

Discord



**International Social Theory Consortium
Fifth Annual Meeting June 6th - June 9th, 2004
York University Glendon Campus
Toronto, Canada**

Hosted by
The Graduate Programme in Social & Political Thought at York University

discords@yorku.ca
<http://www.yorku.ca/spt/consortium/>
<http://www.cas.usf.edu/socialtheory/>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements..... 2

About the Social Theory Consortium3

J_spot: Journal of Social and Political Thought.... 3

Strategies of Critique..... 3

Conference at a Glance.....4-5

Conference Program.....6-17

Abstracts..... 18-55

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Social Theory Consortium thanks to the following for their support:

SSHRC Aid to Occasional Research Conferences and International Congresses
Office of the Principal Glendon College: Dr. Kenneth McRoberts
Office of the Vice President Research: Dr. Stan Shapson
Office of the Vice President Academic: Dr. Sheila Embleton
Faculty of Graduate Studies: Vice President and Dean John Lennox
Faculty of Arts: Dean Robert Drummond
Graduate Programme in Women's Studies, York University
Graduate Programme in Education, York University
Graduate Programme in Anthropology, York University
Graduate Programme in English, York University
Glendon College, York University

The 2004 Social Theory Consortium is hosted by the Graduate Programme in Social and Political Thought at York University. Thanks to the following conference organizers:

Dr. Deborah Britzman
Dr. Barbara Godard
Dr. Brian Singer
Neil Braganza
Baolin Dang
Kate Kaul
Terri Kulak
Alex Levant
Carolyne Topdjian
Kathy Walker
Jude Welburn
Charles Wells
Elleni Centime Zeleki

Thanks also to photographer Shaun O'Boyle for graciously providing us with the photo that appears on the front cover of this booklet and on our poster. To browse O'Boyle's impressive photography, please visit www.oboylephoto.com.

ABOUT THE INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL THEORY CONSORTIUM
<http://www.cas.usf.edu/socialtheory>

The International Social Theory Consortium is a grouping of teaching and research programmes in social theory across the world. It is concerned with new developments in social theory as an inter-disciplinary and post-disciplinary activity which transcends the usual divisions between social science and the humanities. It was initially established by the programmes at the Universities of Kentucky, South Florida, Penn State and Arizona in USA, York in Canada and Sussex and Warwick in Britain. It now has over forty-five programmes affiliated world-wide.

J_spot: JOURNAL OF SOCIAL & POLITICAL THOUGHT
<http://www.yorku.ca/jspot/>

J_spot is an interdisciplinary, electronic journal focusing on a wide range of intersections between theory, politics, culture and social justice. Organizers of this year's 5th Annual Social Theory Consortium Conference hosted by the Social and Political Thought Program at York University will be guest editing a special issue of *J_spot*. This issue will publish a selection of papers presented at this year's conference. All papers will be refereed, and while we cannot guarantee publication we hope that all presenters at the Consortium will consider submitting their paper for this special issue. Articles submitted should not be under simultaneous consideration by any other journal, nor should they have been published elsewhere. Articles should not normally exceed 30 pages of double-spaced text, including endnotes, although longer pieces will be considered. For co-authored works, all authors must submit in writing signed statements attesting to their degree of involvement in the research, writing and/or production of the submission. All papers must be in MLA format.

The deadline for submissions is June 30th, 2004. We hope to send notification of the editorial board's decision by early Fall. Submissions should be emailed to discords@yorku.ca as an attachment or plain-text. They may also be mailed to

Social Theory Consortium and *J_Spot*
c/o Graduate Programme in Social & Political Thought
York University, S716 Ross Building
4700 Keele Street
Toronto, Ontario, Canada
M3J 1P3

STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE:
GRADUATE RESEARCH IN SOCIAL & POLITICAL THOUGHT

"Strategies of Critique" is an annual graduate student conference organized by students in the graduate programme in Social & Political Thought at York University, Toronto. The conference creates opportunities for graduate students to gain experience with academic conferences as participants, presenters, moderators and organizers. Its purpose also is to create a space for substantive dialogue, inquiry and collaboration that will allow graduate students to deepen, sharpen and complicate engagements with interdisciplinary social and political theorization.

This year's Strategies of Critique – the 18th one that has been organized – takes the form of a series of panels on "Strategies of Critique" at the 2004 International Social Theory Consortium. Though all presenters on the "Strategies of Critique" panels are graduate students – from first year MA students to upper-year PhD students – all faculty members and other participants registered at the Social Theory Consortium are warmly welcome to attend and participate in the panels.

International Social Theory Consortium 2004 York University, Toronto	
DAY 1 Sunday June 6th, 2004	DAY 2 Monday June 7th, 2004
	8:30am- 9:30am Registration (York Hall, A Wing)
	9:30am – 11:00am (p.8) Rm 1: Other Communities, Civic Professionalism and Participatory Research Rm 2: Cultural Dimensions Rm 3: Familiar Strangers Rm 4: Strategies of Critique: Agency and Transformation
	11:00am Break
	11:15am – 12:45am (p.9) Rm 1: Cities of Discord Rm 2: The Discordant Social Rm 3: Talking Theory/Power Rm 4: Strategies of Critique: Academy and Genealogy
1:00pm – 2:00pm Registration (York Hall, A Wing)	12:45pm – 2:00pm Lunch break
2:00pm – 3:30pm (p.6) Rm 1: Body and Spirit Rm 2: Consensus and Possibility Rm 3: Politics, Identity and Power in the Periphery Rm 4: Strategies of Critique: Challenging Dialogues	2:00pm – 3:30pm (p.10) Rm 1: Fundamentals Rm 2: Normativity, Heterogeneity and the Social Rm 3: Capitalism and Critique Rm 4: Returning to Frankfurt
3:30pm Break	3:30pm Break
4:00pm – 5:30pm (p.7) Rm 1: Israel and Palestine Rm 2: Poor Oedipus Rm 3: International Concord and Discord, or, Who is the Same? Rm 4: Strangely Familiars	4:00pm – 5:30pm (p.11) Rm 1: After Governmentality Rm 2: Alternative Globalization Rm 3: Strategies of Critique: Representing Eros/Death Rm 4: --
5:30pm Opening Reception: York Hall, front hall. Sponsored by Kenneth McRoberts, Principal of Glendon College.	7:30pm: Dinner and Social (see insert)

International Social Theory Consortium 2004 York University, Toronto	
DAY 3 Tuesday June 8th, 2004	DAY 4 Wednesday June 9th, 2004
8:30am- 9:30am Registration and Light Breakfast (York Hall, A Wing)	8:30am- 9:30am Registration and Light Breakfast (York Hall, A Wing)
9:30am – 11:00am (p.12) General Meeting for the Discussion of Social Theory Consortium, 2005. York Hall room 204.	9:30am – 11:00am (p.16) Rm 1: -- Rm 2: -- Rm 3: Strategies of Critique: Otherwise Than Being Rm 4: --
11:00am Break	11:00am Break
11:15am – 12:45am (p.13) Rm 1: Returning to Weber Rm 2: Media Through the Gaze of Discord Rm 3: Economy and Life Rm 4: After the Work of Art: Responding to Representation	11:15am – 12:45am (p.17) Rm 1: The Demos and Discord Rm 2: Interpretation and Representation Rm 3: Dissensus Rm 4: Strategies of Critique: Excess, Subjection, Ethics
12:45pm – 2:00pm Lunch Break	
2:00pm – 3:30pm (p.14) Rm 1: Ethical Dimensions Rm 2: Disenchanted Modernities Rm 3: Politics of Postmodernism Rm 4: Strategies of Critique: Metaphysics and Political Vision	
3:30pm Break	
4:00pm – 5:30pm (p.15) "Waiting... and Wanting: Pedagogy and the Strange Time of Short Film Presentation". Film and Presentation. Karyn Sandlos (York U, Canada). York Hall room 204	

1:00pm – 2:00pm Sunday June 6th, 2004

Registration, York Hall, A Wing

2:00pm – 3:30pm Sunday June 6th, 2004

Room 1 BODY AND SPIRIT

Moderator: Mark Cauchi (York University) yu133165@yorku.ca

"The Longest Breath There Is: Levinasian Philosophy of Breathing"
Michael Marder (York University, Canada)

"Makarios: The Body at a Point of Revaluation"
John L. Meeks (De La Salle Institute, Philippines)

Room 2 CONSENSUS AND POSSIBILITY

Moderator: Matthew King (York University, Toronto) making@yorku.ca

"Egalitarian Universalism and the Formation of the Demos"
Matthias Fritsch (Concordia University, Canada)

"Democracy, Disagreement, and Rationality"
Juan Albarello (Washington University, USA)

"The War on Essentialism in Social Thought"
Anthony Haynor (Seton Hall University, USA)

Room 3 POLITICS, IDENTITY AND POWER IN THE PERIPHERY

Moderator: Eleni Centime Zeleke (York University, Canada) centime@yorku.ca

"Mexico State's Economic and Political Transition: From Entrepreneurial State to State Entrepreneurs"
Jose G. Vargas-Hernandez (University of Guadalajara, Mexico)

"Return Migrants and Strategic Identity on the Periphery of West African Conflict Zones: Old and New Forms of Personhood in Haute Guinée"
Erin Kenny (University of Kentucky, USA)

"The State, Power, and Developmentality: Discord in the Periphery"
Arslan Dorman (Concordia University, Canada)

Room 4 STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE: CHALLENGING DIALOGUES

Moderator: Nadia Habib (York University, Canada) nadiah@yorku.ca

"Definitions, Community, and Borderlands: The Disruptive Function of Feminist Manifestos by Women of Color"
Elliot Adams (Bowling Green State University, USA)

"Islam and Modernity: the Promise of a Dialogical Understanding"
Ali Hassan Zaidi (York University, Canada)

"Beyond Good and Evil: False Binaries in the September 11th Aftermath"
Joshua Bates (York University, Canada)

4:00pm – 5:30pm Sunday June 6th, 2004

Room 1 ISRAEL AND PALESTINE

Moderator: John Caruana (Ryerson University) jcaruana@arts.ryerson.ca

"Differends, Incommensurables, and Non-Negotiables: The Palestine/Israel or Israel/Palestine 'Question', and Why It Is Not Possible To Talk About It (Even in Western Universities) Without Coming To Blows"
Andrew Wernick (Trent University, Canada)

"Conflict Resolution and Victims of Truth in the Israeli/Palestinian Conflict"
Maisaa Youssef (University of Alberta, Canada)

Room 2 POOR OEDIPUS

Moderator: Patricia Elliott (Wilfrid Laurier U) pelliott@wlu.ca

"On the Comic Trials of Oedipus"
Fadi Abou-Rihan (University of Toronto, Canada)

"Sigmund Freud, Melanie Klein and Little Oedipus: On the Pleasures and Disappointments of Sexual Enlightenment"
Deborah P. Britzman, (York University, Canada)

"His Majesty The Baby: Ego-mimesis, Narcissism and the Politics of Love"
John O'Neill (York University, Canada)

Room 3 INTERNATIONAL CONCORD AND DISCORD, OR, WHO IS THE SAME?

Moderator: Donald V. Poochigian (University of North Dakota) donald.poochigian@und.nodak.edu

"Concord and Discord: The Problem of being-with-Otherness in Contemporary International Relations Theory"
Eric Grah (Queens University, Canada)

"Building on Similarities: Transmodernist Approach in the Analysis of Transnational Conflict"
H. Ayla Kilic (University of Winnipeg, Canada)

"The Concord Imaginary and the Reality of Discord"
Ratiba Hadj-Moussa (York University, Canada)

Room 4 STRANGELY FAMILIARS

Curator and Moderator: Christine Shaw (York U. Canada) cshaw@yorku.ca

"Intuition Is (or Isn't?)..."
Christine Shaw (Artist, Curator; York University, Canada)

"Everybody is my Friend and I am Everybody"
Darren O'Donnell (writer, director, performance artist, designer; Toronto, Canada)

Bewilderments: "Studio Visit"
Aaron Peck (York University, Canada)

"Warm Things to Chew for the Dead"
Diane Borsato (Artist; York University, Canada)

5:45pm -- 7:00pm Sunday June 6th, 2004

Opening Reception, York Hall, front Hall. Sponsored by Kenneth McRoberts, Principal of Glendon College.

8:30am – 9:30am Monday June 7th 2004

Registration. York Hall, A Wing

9:30am – 11:00am Monday June 7th, 2004

Room 1 OTHER COMMUNITIES, CIVIC PROFESSIONALISM AND PARTICIPATORY RESEARCH
Moderator: Wolfgang Natter (University of Kentucky) wnatter@uky.edu

"Theory and Practice at the Scene of Collaboration and Community-Based Research in the East Kentucky Coalfields"
Matt McCourt (University of Kentucky)

"Strange Exchange: Notes From a Local Currency"
Jon Lepofsky (University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill)

"Expert Knowledge, Civic Professionalism, and Global Regional Participatory Research"
Wolfgang Natter (University of Kentucky)

Room 2 CULTURAL DIMENSIONS
Moderator: Christopher Bradd (York University, Canada) csbradd@yorku.ca

"Nation, State and Pluralism: a Sociological Approach"
Elke Winter (York University, Canada)

"The State of Social Sciences in Australia: A Survey Essay Commissioned by the Human Capital Committee Social Science Research Council"
Trevor Hogan (Latrobe University, Australia)

"Consuming Childhood"
Beryl A. Langer (LaTrobe University, Australia)

Room 3 FAMILIAR STRANGERS
Curator and Moderator: Christine Shaw (York U. Canada) cshaw@yorku.ca

"Performance Spaces for Animals"
Joanne Bristol (Artist, Banff, Alberta College of Art and Design, Calgary, Canada)

Bewilderments: "Diorama"
Aaron Peck (York University, Canada)

"Ambience for a Future City"
Adrian Blackwell (Artist/Architect, University of Toronto, Canada) and Kika Thorne (Artist, CMCE/OISE, University of Toronto, Canada)

Room 4 STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE: AGENCY AND TRANSFORMATION
Moderator: Sonya Scott (York University, Canada) smscott@yorku.ca

"Existential-(Marxism) and Autonomous Praxis"
Greg Bird (York University, Canada)

"Rethinking Spontaneity: Re-reading Luxemburg through Benjamin"
Alex Levant (York University, Canada)

"Why Do We Have to Return to the 'Subject'?: Karel Kosik's and Enzo Paci's Criticism of the Reductionism of the Official Marx-Leninism."
Nakjung Kim (York University, Canada)

11:15am – 12:45pm Monday June 7th, 2004

Room 1 CITIES OF DISCORD
Moderator: Tara Milbrandt (York University, Canada) tmilbran@yorku.ca

"City of Discord"
Engin Isin (York University, Canada)

"Discordant Order in the New Urbanism of Asia-Pacific Cities"
Peter Murphy & Trevor Hogan (Latrobe University, Australia & Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand)

"Discordant People: Street Youth and the City-Scape"
John M. Bodner (Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada)

Room 2 THE DISCORDANT SOCIAL
Moderator: Brian Singer (York University, Canada) bsinger@yorku.ca

"Gabriel Tarde and Social Theory"
David Toews (Michigan State University)

"Social Responsibility of What?"
Denise Kleinrichert (University of South Florida, USA)

"Cinema Sans Frontieres?: Edgar Morin's The Cinema or Imaginary Man"
Lorraine Mortimer (Latrobe University, Australia)

Room 3 TALKING THEORY/POWER
Moderator: Claudio Colaguori claudio.ac@rogers.com

"Current Problems in Theorizing about the Meaning of Empowerment"
Brian Thomas (UNC, USA)

"Not Talking the Talk"
Douglas Aoki (University of Alberta, Canada)

"W(h)ither the Party paper?: The 'Communicative Crisis' of Marxism in the 20th Century"
Herbert Pimlott (Wilfrid Laurier University, Canada)

Room 4 STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE: ACADEMY AND GENEALOGY
Moderator: Karen Ruddy (York University, Canada) kruddy@yorku.ca

"Dreaming home, finding home"
Eva Portillo (York University, Canada)

"Neoliberalism, Turnitin, and the Policing of the University"
Ryan Toews (York University, Canada)

"Shot Through the Heart: The State, Sovereignty and Genealogy as a Strategy of Critique"
Colleen Bell (York University, Canada)

12:45pm – 2:00pm Monday June 7th, 2004

Lunch Buffet at the Faculty Club, York Hall, Albert Tucker Room. Tickets: \$20.

2:00pm – 3:30pm Monday June 7th, 2004

Room 1 FUNDAMENTALS

Moderator: Scott Schaffer (Millersville University of Pennsylvania, USA) scott.schaffer@millersville.edu

"Polemos: Social Theory and Social Conflict"
Ian Angus (Simon Fraser University, Canada)

"Discordant Tones of Enlightenment"
Colm Kelly (St. Thomas University, Canada)

Room 2 NORMATIVITY, HETEROGENEITY AND THE SOCIAL

Moderator: Kristine Klement (York University, Canada) kklement@yorku.ca

"Discord as Heterogeneity: Linking Micro and Macro Perspectives"
Carla Valle (Harvard University, USA)

"Gabriel Tarde and the Ontology of the Social"
Roar Hostaker (Lillehammer University College, Norway)

"Normalization vs. Normativity"
Lorna Weir (York University, Canada)

Room 3 CAPITALISM AND CRITIQUE

Moderator: Karen Walker (York University, Canada) kiwalker@yorku.ca

"May 68: the End of an Era, and the Beginning of a New One"
David Allen (Georgia Southern University)

"Theorizing Capitalism"
Hans-Peter Muller (Institut für Sozialwissenschaften der Humbolt-U zu Berlin, Germany)

"Workers Unite, You Have More to Lose than your Mortgage"
Shokoufeh Sakhi (York University, Canada)

Room 4 RETURNING TO FRANKFURT

Moderator: Michael Marder (York University, Canada) misham@yorku.ca

"Bauman and the Frankfurt School on the Holocaust"
Timo Juetten (University of Sussex, UK)

"Mimesis, Identity-thinking and the Evolution of Society: Adorno's Critical Anthropology"
Philip Walsh (SUNY Cortland, USA)

"Universals and Eternal Objects: The Social Philosophy and H Marcuse and A.N. Whitehead"
Duston Moore (Indiana University / Purdue University Fort Wayne, USA)

4:00pm – 5:30pm Monday June 7th, 2004

Room 1 AFTER GOVERNMENTALITY (see p. 19 for panel description)

Moderator: Colleen Bell (York University, Canada) cbell@yorku.ca

"Foundering in the Fields of Freedom: Governmentality as Conducting the Conduct of 'Freedom From', 'Freedom To', or 'Freedom Through' in Contemporary Global Spaces"
Timothy W. Luke (Virginia Tech University, USA)

"John Stuart as political Problematization: Laughter and the Refiguring of Political Action After Governmentality"
Jamie Warner (Marshall University, USA)

"Foucault, Pragmatism and Political Activity in a Regulatory America"
Chris Russill (Pennsylvania State University, USA)

"Governing the Spirit of Capitalism: pastoral Power, Scientific Discourse and Techniques of the Working Self"
George Vivien Davis (Virginia Tech University, USA)

Room 2 ALTERNATIVE GLOBALIZATION

Moderator: Ratiba Hadj-Moussa (York University, Canada) rhj@yorku.ca

"Husserl's Social Theory and Globalization"
Gregory Cameron (Trent University, Canada)

"Alternative Globalization and the Practice of Cosmopolitan Solidarity"
Fuyuki Kurasawa (York University, Canada)

"Networks, Community and Discord"
Philip Armstrong (Ohio State University, USA)

Room 3 STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE: REPRESENTING EROS/DEATH

Moderator: Penelope Ironstone-Catterall, (Wilfrid Laurier U) pironsto@wlu.ca

"Fucking Ourselves to Death: Bataille, Sex, and Art."
Jessica Cameron (York University, Canada)

"The Counter-Monument as Ruin: Exploring the Problematic of Remembering/Forgetting"
Kate Zankowicz (Concordia University, Canada)

"I Can't Stop Watching CNN: Derrida and the A-Politics of Melancholia"
Kathy Walker (York University, Canada)

8:30am – 9:30am Tuesday June 8th, 2004

Registration, York Hall, A Wing

9:30am – 11:00am Tuesday June 8th, 2004

General Meeting for the Discussion of Social Theory Consortium, 2005
York Hall, room 204

SOCIAL THEORY CONSORTIUM – PARTICIPATING ORGANIZATIONS

Core Institutions

- Penn State University: Social Thought Program
- Univ. of Arizona: Comparative Cultural and Literary Studies
- UC-Davis: Center for History, Society, and Culture
- Univ. of Kentucky: Committee on Social Theory

Others

- Australian National University: Social and Political Theory
- Bowland College Lancaster University: Institute for Cultural Research
- Cambridge University: Political Thought and Intellectual History
- Carleton College: Social Thought Concentration
- Columbia U.: Political Theory Subfield
- University College Cork Department of Sociology
- Edinburgh University: Social and Political Theory
- European University Institute: Department of Social and Political Sciences
- George Mason University: Cultural Studies Doctoral Program
- George Washington University: Interdisciplinary Program in Human Sciences
- Goldsmiths College: Centre for Cultural Studies
- Harvard University: Committee on Degrees in Social Studies
- Hillsdale College: Sociology and Social Thought Program
- Latrobe University, Thesis Eleven Center
- Mount Holyoke College: Critical Social Thought Interdisciplinary Program
- New School: for Social Research
- Nottingham Trent: Theory, Culture and Society
- San Francisco State U.: Critical Social Thought Program
- Stanford Program in Modern Thought and Literature
- Texas-Arlington, Texas-Austin, UCLA, UC-Irvine, Virginia Tech: Center for Theory
- The Queen's University of Belfast: Post-Structuralism and Radical Politics Specialist Group

- Univ. of South Florida: Center for Social and Political Thought
- Univ. of Sussex: Social and Political Thought
- Univ. of Warwick: Social and Political Thought
- York University: Social and Political Thought Programme

- U. of Birmingham: Department of Cultural Studies and Sociology
- UCLA: Center for Social Theory and Comparative History
- U. of California Santa Cruz: Graduate Program in History of Consciousness
- U. of Chicago: The Committee on Social Thought
- U. of Edinburgh: MSc/Diploma – Social and Political Theory
- University of Essex: Centre for Theoretical Studies
- Universidad Federal da Bahia, Brazil: Philosophy and Social Theory
- University of Illinois-Urbana: Unit for Criticism and Interpretive Theory
- U. of Massachusetts at Amherst: Social Thought and Political Economics
- University of Maryland: Theory Program
- University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill: University Program in Cultural Studies
- U. of Melbourne: Ashworth Centre for Social Theory
- University of Nottingham: Postgraduate School of Critical Theory
- U. of Victoria: Concentration in Contemporary Social and Political Thought
- U. of Virginia: The Political and Social Thought Program
- University of the West of England, Centre for Critical Theory
- Vilnius University: Department of Social Theory
- Washington University: Committee on Social Thought and Analysis
- Westminster: Centre for the Study of Democracy

11:15am – 12:45pm Tuesday June 8th, 2004

Room 1 RETURNING TO WEBER

Moderator: Brian Fuller (York University, Canada) bfuller@yorku.ca

"The Expertization of National Violence from Weber to Morgenthau"
Stephen Turner (South Florida University, USA)

"Weber, Toller, and Political Discord"
Christopher Adair-Toteff (Mississippi State University, USA)

"Can Value Polytheism and the Preference of any Comprehensive Model of Citizenship be respected at the same time? – or – Some Reflections on the Complexity of Political and Social Tissue and the Irreducible Discords it Implies."
Rafal Pawel Wierzoslawski (Catholic University of Lublin, Poland)

Room 2 MEDIA THROUGH THE GAZE OF DISCORD

Moderator: Ian Roderick (Wilfrid Laurier U) iroderick@sprint.ca

"Discord: A Positive Re-Appraisal Based on New Media"
Mark Passera (Bournemouth Media School, UK)

"Aporia, Media and Conflict: The Rise of Ressentiment"
Jeff Shires (Purdue University North Central, USA)

"Changing the Rules of Engagement: The Role of Videogames in the Struggle for Social Justice"
Jesse Payne. (York University, Canada)

Room 3 ECONOMY AND LIFE

Moderator: Trevor Norris (OISE/ University of Toronto) trevornorris71@hotmail.com

"The Life Aporia of Marxian Theory"
John-Justin McMurtry (York University, Canada)

"The Dilempted Human Condition: Labour, Work, and Action in Hannah Arendt"
Michael Palamarek (York University, Canada)

"Etienne Balibar's Transformation of Marxism"
K. D. Kang (University of Brighton, UK)

Room 4 AFTER THE WORK OF ART: RESPONDING TO REPRESENTATION

Moderator: Deborah P. Britzman (York U, Canada) britzman@edu.yorku.ca

"Charlotte Salomon: From the Archive to the Art Gallery"
Elisabeth Friedman (York University, Canada)

"AIDS, Aesthetics and the Ethics of Failing to Respond in Time"
Karyn Sandlos (York University, Canada)

"An Ethics of Failure: Thinking about the photographs from Abu Ghraib"
Sharon Sliwinski (York University, Canada)

12:45pm - 2:00pm Tuesday June 8th, 2004

Lunch Buffet at the Faculty Club. York Hall, Albert Tucker Room Tickets: \$20.

2:00pm - 3:30pm Tuesday June 8th, 2004

Room 1 ETHICAL DIMENSIONS

Moderator: Victoria Tahmasebi (York U, Canada) tahmaseb@yorku.ca

"Discordant Ethics: Valuing and Ethos of Fragility"
Scott Schaffer (Millersville University of Pennsylvania, USA)

"The Discordant Self: On Some of the Enigmas of Conscience"
John Caruana (Ryerson University, Canada)

"What Exactly Was It That Bernard Williams Criticized?"
Kevin Gray (University of Toronto, Canada)

Room 2 DISENCHANTED MODERNITIES

Moderator: Emmanuel Raymundo (Yale University) emmanuel.raymundo@yale.edu

"At Odds with Animals: Philosophical Modernity and the War on Brutes"
David L. Clark (McMaster University, Canada)

"Schooling and Social Theory: Towards a Political Economy of Truth"
David Allen (Georgia Southern University)

"Religious Envisioning and the Crisis of Political Faith"
James E. Block (DePaul University, USA)

Room 3 POLITICS OF POSTMODERNISM

Moderator: Nandita Biswas Mellamphy (University of Toronto) nbiswas@chass.utoronto.ca

"Multiculturalism and the Postmodern Politics of Difference"
Thomas Powers (University of Minnesota, USA)

"Streamed Capitalism, Cynical Data and Hyper-Nihilism"
Arthur Kroker (University of Victoria, Canada)

Room 4 STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE: METAPHYSICS AND POLITICAL VISION

Moderator: Mark Jull (York U, Canada) mjull@yorku.ca

"Our 'Saving Power?' Integral Vision as a Response to the Danger of Technology"
Catherine Swenson (York University, Canada)

"Signifying Humanism: Heidegger and National Identity in Nineteenth-Century American Fiction"
Karen Walker (York University, Canada)

"To Whom Does the Critic Write?: Habermas and Foucault on Universalism, Partisanship, and Foundations"
Matthew King (York University, Canada)

4:00pm - 5:30pm Tuesday June 8th, 2004

Film and Presentation

"Waiting... and Wanting: Pedagogy and the Strange Time of Short Film Presentation."
Karyn Sandlos (York University, Canada). York Hall, room 204

Moderated by Carol Zemel (York University, Canada) czemel@yorku.ca



8:30am - 9:30am Wednesday June 9th 2004

Registration. York Hall, A Wing

9:30am - 11:00am Wednesday June 9th, 2004

Room 3 STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE: OTHERWISE THAN BEING

Moderator: Dan Mellamphy (York University, Canada) mellamphy@rogers.com

"On Levinas's Esotericism"

Neil Braganza (York University, Canada)

"An Antidote for Self Delusion: Madhyamaka, Brain Science, and Phenomenological Experience in the Search for (No)Self."

Baolinh Dang (York University, Canada)

"Political Sovereignty and Ethical Response"

Jon Short (York University, Canada)



"Schroeder's Tantrum" (Earl MacDonald CD Radioland recording label, Canada)

11:15am - 12:45pm Wednesday June 9th, 2004

Room 1 THE DEMOS AND DISCORD

Moderator: Mark Blackell (Dalhousie University) blackell@dal.ca

"Discord, Potential and Machiavelli's Concept of Virtue"
Graeme Stout (University of Minnesota, USA)

"Democracy and Social Creativity"
Craig Browne (University of Sydney, Australia)

"Schiller, Aesthetics and Politics"
Andrea Dumbrell (University of Western Ontario, Canada)

Room 2 INTERPRETATION AND REPRESENTATION

Moderator: Ilya Parkins (York U, Canada) ilyap@yorku.ca

"Pragmatism and Self-Referential Knowledge"
Patrick Baert (University of Cambridge, UK)

"Beyond Rorty's Sociological Definition of Knowledge"
Fernando Dominguez Rubio (University of Cambridge, UK)

"Discord and Concord"
Donald V Poochigian (University of North Dakota, USA)

Room 3 DISSENSUS

Moderator: Barbara Godard (York U, Canada) bgodard@yorku.ca

"Democracy, Performance and the Being of Bees"
Mielle Chandler (York University, Canada)

"What is Rhizophenomenology?"
Astrida Neimanis (York University, Canada)

Room 4 STRATEGIES OF CRITIQUE: EXCESS, SUBJECTION, ETHICS

Moderator: Neil Braganza (York University, Canada) braganza@yorku.ca

"Ethical/Political Subjects: Reflections on Althusser and Caputo"
Karen Ruddy (York University, Canada)

"Political Economy and General Economy"
Colin Campbell (York University, Canada)

"Masochism and Identification: Queer Attachments to Subjection"
Kristine Klement (York University, Canada)

Abou-Rihan, Fadi (University of Toronto, Canada)

On the Comic Trials of Oedipus

Psychoanalysis has rightly insisted on the doubled and conflicted relationship a subject has with its object. Freud, Klein, and Lacan have argued for the co-valence of the oppositional pair whenever they addressed questions of perversion, position, or presence. Puzzling then is the psychoanalytic refusal to detect anything other than the tortured and the tragic in the myth of Oedipus. Puzzling is the discipline's refusal to grant its hermeneutic key access to a logic of duality that would uncover in Oedipus his constitutive roots in the comedic. The earnestness with which psychoanalysis has championed the story of the erstwhile King of Thebes as the embodiment of pathos and nothing but is itself the symptom of an inhibition that is in need of analysis, an inhibition that is all the more potent because of its silence and opacity, an inhibition that functions in the mode of a yet unspoken eleventh (psychoanalytic) commandment: Thou shalt not laugh.

This essay braids a number of cultural factors along with some key metapsychological tenets in order to re-interpret the Sophoclean script as much less the literal account of a psychological bedrock and much more the ever-changing outcome of a process of manipulation and revision that incorporates and demands a host of discordant strategies and responses.

Adair-Toteff, Christopher (Mississippi State University)

csat@comcast.net

Weber, Toller, and Political Discord

In *Politik als Beruf* Max Weber set out his two opposing types of ethics. The first type is the "ethics of responsibility" in which the political actor attempts to foresee possible results from acting. The second type is the "ethics of conviction" in which the political actor rejects any accounting of possible results and instead maintains a stance based simply upon ethical considerations. As Weber pointed out, these two types of ethics are at odds with one another: in the first consequences are considered, in the second consequences are rejected. For Weber, Ernst Toller was the embodiment of the ethics of conviction. Toller was for a time a member of the Webers' Sunday group and Weber thought highly enough to defend Toller against the charge of high treason. Nonetheless, Weber had strong and opposing thoughts regarding Toller. In this paper I will examine the sources and consequences of the political discord embodied by Weber and Toller that led up to and continued during and after the 1918/1919 Munich revolution.

Adams, Elliot (Bowling Green State University, USA)

eadams73@hotmail.com

Definitions, Community, and Borderlands: The Disruptive Function of Feminist Manifestos by Women of Color

As documents that operate within an ideological sphere, American feminist manifestos engage with and reveal some of the political dimensions of consciousness and being; one of those dimensions is race, and more specifically, whiteness. As a function of privilege, and consequently visibility, whiteness exists in both bodily and discursive forms, among them manifestos. White feminists' manifestos contribute to a white-centered American history by attracting or creating historical attention; further, manifestos by white feminists perpetuate whiteness by choosing their own historical moments to create a rupture in the apparently seamless forward progression of historical movement. On the other hand, manifestos by feminists of color are viewed as aberrations of historical contribution, not as mainstream documents. However, American feminist manifestos written by women of color contest the ideology and subjectivity of whiteness by highlighting the construction of whiteness and calling it into question.

My paper will briefly outline manifestos as a performative genre, and then discuss some of the ways in which manifestos by Sojourner Truth, the Combahee River Collective, and Gloria Anzaldua draw attention to the construction of white subjectivity and contest the hegemony of whiteness in America.

After Governmentality (Room 1, 4:00pm – 5:30pm, Monday June 7th 2004)

Panel Description:

Building on Michel Foucault's attempt to recapture the nuances of the concept of government and drawing from the various processes of what he calls "governmentality," these papers theorize the possibility of politics in a governed world, that is, in a world where social and political actors recognize the complexity of governmentality and use this recognition in an attempt to renegotiate the terms of political life.

The papers on this panel range from the diagnostic (concerned with coming to terms with governmentality as a fact of contemporary life, explaining what it means to be governed, and considering the implications of a political reality where "freedom from" government is impossible), to the prescriptive (attempting to refigure possibilities for political action in light of this governed reality).

Albarello, Juan (Washington University, USA)

iggomeza@artsci.wustl.edu

Democracy, Disagreement, and Rationality

I claim that there are serious problems associated with the direction taken by the neo-Kantian reconstruction of democratic theory in regards the way it links the use of citizen's capacities and the functioning of democracy. I substantiate this claim, first, showing that the neo-Kantian project has contributed to obscure what rationality entails in practical matters: that reason exerts a non-coercive force to agree. The consequence of such misunderstanding, I argue, is to lose sight of the significance of majority rule. I then push a reinterpretation of the ideal role taking position and a rehabilitation of majority rule that is, however, close to the core of Habermas' theory of democracy.

Allen, David (Georgia Southern University)

dallen@georgiasouthern.edu

May 68: the End of an Era, and the Beginning of a New One

This paper examines ways 'self-management' and 'autonomy' was introduced into the May revolution in France of 1968. An alternative narrative is offered of the events that highlight the movements' important successes and failures. The paper offers an alternative scenario of how events might have played out along with lessons worth applying for DIY and anti-globalization movements of today. The paper concludes that the enduring significance of May 68 was not the success or failures to introduce worker's councils but rather the inauguration of a new practical critique of modern schooling and technocratic society.

Schooling and Social Theory: Towards a Political Economy of Truth

This paper groups together and examines the work of several recent social theorists: Bauman, Foucault, Gatto, Illich, Ranciere and Roszak who are discussed and considered as providing the foundations for a critique of modern schooling. These theorists regard schooling as a secular religion for modern technocratic society. The industrialization of schooling has entailed a radical division of social reality into 2 realms: where learning necessitates segregation of the young and the uneducated along with a dependency upon teachers. Education becomes otherworldly, and the world becomes un-educational. School sanctifies and legitimates certain more wide-ranging social divisions and separations: between knowing and doing, teacher and student, leader and led, mental and manual labor, expert and lay-person, disciplinary knowledge and everyday life, managerial control and popular participation. School requires of its participants a surrendering of subjectivity up to a faith in science and progress. School is where people learn to accept some rank bestowed upon them, based upon their 'objective worth', where people learn to live in a totally managed world and accept their lives as best managed and directed by expert elites. The paper suggests seeing schooling as a new kind of state religion where the subject becomes co-conspirator in the domination of their own

identity. It also suggests simple ways the subject can begin to reclaim their identity by becoming the center of their own activity.

Angus, Ian (Simon Fraser University)

iangus@sfu.ca

Polemos: Social Theory and Social Conflict

Beginning from Edmund Husserl's notion of self-responsibility, the paper will chart a passage through Heidegger's reappropriation of the concept of polemos in the 1930's to Heraclitus' original formulation. A discussion of Heraclitus will focus on the meaning of the concept of fire and the banishment of comedy due to its reflexive nature. The importance of this reflexivity for addressing key problems of contemporary social theory will be the conclusion.

Aoki, Douglas (University of Alberta, Canada)

aoki@ualberta.ca

Not Talking the Talk

If the University has lately become a place of discord, its practice of social theory – at least theory sensitive to French efforts since the mid-20th century – has been in discord from the beginning. Such social theory has sweeping implications for discourse in general and for the discourses of the academy in particular. Yet the professional discourses of contemporary theory, despite avowing the materiality of the signifier and contesting the disciplining by performative practice, remain indistinguishable in appearance from those of any other academic area. Theorists usually lecture in their classrooms the same way that non-theorists do; they usually write papers that look the same and usually publish those papers in comfortably familiar journals; they usually respond to traditional calls for papers with traditional 150-word abstracts. Theory merrily talks and writes as if theory doesn't apply to itself.

Armstrong, Phillip (Ohio State University)

armstrong.202@osu.edu

Networks, Community, and Discord

The paper questions the assumption that networks are primarily systems of communication established through the increasingly available use and speed of information technology. Rather, a genealogy of the concept suggests that networks have always engaged questions of community, both within and across cultures, in particular through definitions and (re)creations of social bonds (understood here in the larger context of allegiances, coalitions, co-operatives, fraternities, partnerships, alliances, etc.) Networks articulate both social exchanges and forms of "equivalence building" between groups and individuals and across territorial boundaries. They further suggest different ways of conceiving both social relations on a global as well as local scale as well as the various traditions (political, sociological and anthropological) of social "contract" or kinship. In light of this context and the increasingly pervasive appeals to networks in social and political theory, the paper thus asks how networks are capable of opening the space of irreducible conflict, confrontation, as well as the possibility of social discrepancy and discord.

Baert, Patrick (University of Cambridge, UK)

pinb100@cam.ac.uk

Pragmatism and Self-Referential Knowledge.

The paper reflects on the possibility of a social science that aims at self-referential knowledge-acquisition. This form of social research explores and questions deep-seated presuppositions prevalent in contemporary culture and strives to become aware of other forms of life. This view of social sciences, therefore, is perfectly in line with the pragmatist perspective that language and knowledge, rather than acts of representation, allow people to increase the scope of

human possibilities. Various forms of social research, in a wide range of disciplines, have already explored this self-referential knowledge. Nietzsche's genealogical method is an obvious illustration, which has recently found applications in several academic subjects such as history and sociology. There are also less well-known or at least more discipline-bound examples, such as the emergence of post-processual archaeology and the critical turn in anthropology. These examples show that, rather than being a mere theoretical construct, the pursuit of self-referential knowledge acquisition can form highly successful research strategies in a multitude of fields.

Bates, Joshua (York University, Canada)

jbates@yorku.ca

Beyond Good and Evil: False Binaries in the September 11th Aftermath

The September 11th terrorist attacks elicited a dichotomizing response from diverse parties, including the Bush administration, Osama bin Laden's al Qaeda network and North American social justice coalitions. The struggle between "good" and "evil" has never had as clear and unambiguous a meaning as those defining the terms would like us to believe. The aftermath of September 11th is no exception; while many maintain that a "moral clarity" arose out of the ashes of the collapsed World Trade Centre towers, the lines between "good/evil, us/them, civilized/barbaric, American/enemies" cannot be so easily drawn. It is argued that the counter position of such categories is rooted in an elite global agenda dominated by select figures who have forged close ties to the White House, and that this polarization is mirrored in the rhetorical response of both social justice activists and bin Laden himself. The meaning, construction and implications of the Bush administration's dichotomizing world-view are discussed, along with the ways in which opposition groups reflect this simplistic and reductionist logic. In response to September 11th, it is argued that a new language that does not reflect the narrow world-view espoused by both Bush and bin Laden must be adopted by social justice activists.

Bell, Colleen (York University, Canada)

cbell@yorku.ca

Shot Through the Heart: The State, Sovereignty and Genealogy as a Strategy of Critique

This paper consists of a review of literature that addresses genealogy as a strategy of historical critique. It focuses on literature that attempts to apply genealogical method to an analysis of the ontological status of the state as the foundation for political order and the study of politics. It also considers how genealogical analysis of sovereignty can be used to question sovereignty as the organizing principle for the study and demarcation of domestic and international politics. It is argued that genealogical critique can be deployed to understand the state and sovereignty not as foundational, but as contingent upon history and the study of politics.

Bird, Greg (York University, Canada)

redqueer@yorku.ca

Existential-(Marxism) and Autonomous Praxis

This paper reviews two political texts that have been ignored in North America: Cornelius Castoriadis' *The Imaginary Institution of Society* and Jean-Paul Sartre's *Critique of Dialectical Reason*, vol. 1. This is unfortunate, because they are two of the strongest political texts operating within the Continental tradition that deal specifically with revolutionary praxis.

They work together because both share the ontological premise that humans are embodied in the social. In Sartre this is emphasized in his concept of the third person. Being in this position provides a social mediation that acts as a totalization and unifies various isolated fields of practice. Whereas in Castoriadis, social being is emphasized by a subject's condition of being determined by her participation in the world. However, for both theorists, the positive potentialities of social existence are largely prevented from being practiced in capitalist modes of existence. Because

within them, the prevailing conditions support the continuance of automatized and alienated modalities of being and most of our actions within these modes actually work to deter us from developing free praxes. This is problematic for existential-(Marxist) projects because here passive existents are externally ascribed meanings of the world, rather than actively engaging in producing them themselves. Nevertheless, there is the potentiality to overcome these alienating circumstances because of our shared existence in the social. When recognized, this shared relationship should necessarily produce a reciprocal responsibility to work collectively towards the development of a relatively autonomous, free and egalitarian mode of existence. So in this paper I will explore how both of these projects give us insights as to how we can work towards this.

Blackwell, Adrian (Artist/Architect; University of Toronto, Canada) and **Kika Thorne** (Artist; CMCE/OISE, University of Toronto, Canada)

Ambience for a Future City

We started this project during the darkest moments of common sense conservatism in Ontario. Its begins from the conviction that urban space is emphasized in contemporary discussions as a profitable and competitive territory for economic expansion, as a result the city was being reconfigured to reject undesirable elements, repressive mechanisms were intensified, rent controls and zoning regulations were relaxed, and public housing was suppressed for almost a decade.

Our projects approach these events with a simple question: how can city residents gain creative agency in the construction of city space? We examine this question through the presentation and explanation of three collaborative projects completed since 1997. The first ("Mattress City") looks at the public mobilization of collective energy as an attempt to influence the political transformation of urban governance. The second ("1:1 over 1:300") examines the gulf that exists between subjective experience and urban transformation (the tactical and the strategic); and the final project ("Ambience for a Future") challenges active counter publics to project their visions and ideas for our city's future development. We are interested in the term ambience because it emphasizes city space as experience and reintroduces questions of necessity and pleasure into a radical critique of the contemporary city.

Block, James (DePaul University)

jblock@condor.depaul.edu

Religious Envisioning and the Crisis of Political Faith

The West and its theorists as evidenced in the conference thematics continue, in the words of Paul Ricoeur, to mourn the loss of Hegel. What is meant by the vector of value is I fear the once-complacent sense that the progressive dialectic was proceeding on autopilot. No wonder we have hit a reef.

The face of this particular reef is discord the wish to escape from a perceived hegemony to the painful disgust/trauma but ultimately self-medicating backwater pools of ahistoricism, the end of meaning, where noise too has its pleasures. What this also complacent view hides is that the hegemony feared exists largely because progressives continue to accept the underlying values of the ascendant Protestant-liberal world. Standing upon the very ground of their opposition, they of course have nowhere outside to go.

It is not the too Protestant-liberal discursive rationalities that will open new doors but by theorizing hegemony. We must uncover the deep religious/theological assumptions of this modernity and in turn offer a renewed vision of religious and human possibility in this post-industrial age, an age, after all, of unprecedented opportunity.

I want in this paper to explore the conditions facing and possible directions offered to a post-imperial religious envisioning that would restore if not enchantment certainly faith within the post-industrial American world system in future vectors and to challenge progressive social theory to take up this for many discordant project.

Bodner, John (Memorial University)

h63jmb@mun.ca

Discordant People: Street Youth and the City-Scape

Based upon intensive fieldwork with a group of homeless youth in downtown Toronto, this presentation argues that street youth have been defined as a danger to the urban landscape and those that occupy it, not solely because of their subsistence activities but because their very existence destabilizes the normative reading of the urban built environment. My talk will address three interrelated aspects of this phenomenon: first, the ways in which the city can be read as the encoding of social structures through the built environment (Glassie 1973, Yi Fu Tuan 1977); second, why the survival strategies of street kids violate the normative order of the urban landscape (Wardaugh 2000; Massey 1994); finally, how various agents of coercive state control used this discord to define street youth as "disorderly people" and a threat to the very fabric of urban life (Hermer and Mosher 2002). The subsequent criminalization of their daily activities threatens not only the lives of youth on the street but also the ways in which the city will be defined, used, built and rebuilt for all of us in the future.

Borsato, Diane (Artist; York University, Canada)

Warm Things to Chew for the Dead

This presentation will be a performative artist talk which will feature several of my public performances, urban interventions, and private experiments. Projects such as *HOW TO MAKE A SCULPTURE IN AN EMERGENCY* (Skol, Montreal, 2001) – in which 60 members of the public were invited to break a Guinness world record for the longest paperclip chain – takes up issues of commitment to a task and relationality in performance art history, to reconciling how greatness is measured in modernist aesthetics and in popular culture. Urban interventions such as *The Taste of Love Awards* (Montreal 1999-2000) given to Montreal restaurants and *Touching 1000 People* (Montreal 2000/ Vancouver 2003) engaged the other people in the city in a range of ways that speak to developing notions of the artist/individual moving through city, and the work of public art. Projects such as *Sleeping with Cake* (Montreal 1999) in which I slept with comfort food in an effort to discover if it would be comforting, and *Artifacts in my Mouth* (Ste.Hyacinthe 2003) where I was permitted to briefly put a variety of museum artifacts into my mouth, and *WARM THINGS TO CHEW FOR THE DEAD* (Nice, 2003) in which I left warm and succulent foods for the long-dead in French cemeteries – are among a larger series of eccentric experiments and surprising gestures which point to various ways one might engage their sense of intimacy and touch to take in knowledge, comfort, and meaning.

Braganza, Neil (York University, Canada)

braganza@yorku.ca

On Levinas's Esotericism

Levinas's critique of ontology reverses rational self-grounding activity into an obligation and debt to an "other" who is prior to or beyond any ground or activity of self-grounding. But insofar as self-grounding activity is at work in the formation both of politics and of knowledge, its critique is both philosophical and political (and never one without being the other). This paper argues that Levinas's ethics invokes a certain ambivalence between philosophy and politics that his writings do not successfully deal with and explain. The paper advances the thesis that this philosophical/political ambivalence is forced to remain an esoteric dimension in the Levinasian texts because of Levinas's reliance on the phenomenological method he inherits from Husserl. The paper concludes by arguing that for us rethink Levinasian ethics in light of an adequate understanding of its philosophical-political ambivalence, we must do so as a practical inquiry into the role self-identical claims, ideas or axioms play in social, political and psychic life (an inquiry that departs from phenomenological reflection strictly speaking).

Bristol, Joanne (Artist, Banff; Alberta College of Art and Design, Calgary, Canada)

Performance Spaces for Animals

This presentation will discuss a number of collaborations between artists and domestic animals in time-based artwork over the past two decades. I am interested in the liminal or unmarked spaces created through human and animal liaisons, and how these inform the creation of identities and ontologies. Questions raised will include: How and what can humans perform for animals? How can boundaries between performer and audience, and animal and human be productively shifted? Through referencing works by Carolee Schneeman, Eduardo Kac and others, I will consider the hybrid spaces – physical, virtual and especially domestic – created through inter-species exchanges.

The central focus of the presentation will be recent video and installation work I have produced with my cat, Sabre. The work presents performances made in my apartment, which raise questions about human and animal perception, representation, subjectivity, play and the construction of meaning. Through these works I imagine or propose relationships based on hybridity and ambiguity rather than the control-and-management paradigms which currently dominate human and animal exchanges. The nature of performance and the performance of nature will be reconsidered through a feminist embrace of the everyday, and the sentimental.

Britzman, Deborah P. (York University, Canada)

britzman@edu.yorku.ca

Sigmund Freud, Melanie Klein and Little Oedipus: On the Pleasures and Disappointments of Sexual Enlightenment

Before the concept of "the Oedipus complex" entered Freud's writings, there was the figure of "little Oedipus" and the "little sex researcher." These figures seemed to stabilize Freud's view on the importance of sexual enlightenment of children as a means to prevent the future of neurosis. Freud also depended upon Kant's understanding of enlightenment as a move from immaturity to maturity. Yet given the anti-developmental stance of psychoanalysis, how is sexual enlightenment even possible? Working with two case studies of children, Freud's "Little Hans" and Klein's "Fritz" this paper considers some psychoanalytic debates on the status of knowledge and sexuality.

Browne, Craig (University of Sydney)

craig.browne@arts.usyd.edu.au

Democracy and Social Creativity

This paper examines attempts to interlink notions of social creativity and democracy. It elucidates the differences and similarities between the ideas of creative democracy and democratic creativity. Creative democracy is associated with the tradition of pragmatist philosophy, especially with the work of John Dewey and George Herbert Mead. Whereas democratic creativity constitutes a point of reference for a number of distinctive, though nonetheless related, programs in contemporary French social and political theory. In particular, Castoriadis, Lefort and Touraine have sought to articulate a politics of democratic creativity that differs from political models based on liberal notions of autonomy. Similarly, the common understanding of creative democracy as a variant of the liberal developmental model underestimates its particular features. A common feature of these various linkages of creativity and democracy is the attempt to theorise emergence and innovation as central principles of individual and social autonomy.

Cameron, Gregory (Trent University, Canada)

gregory.cameron@sympatico.ca

Husserl's Social Theory and Globalization

In thinking of social theory one is not often drawn to the writings of Husserl, except, that is, in order to dismiss his attempts. Husserl's Vienna Lecture, his most sustained writing on social issues, has become something of a paradigm of Eurocentric social theory, precisely, it is said, what social theory should avoid. And yet, Husserl's social theory

remains one of the few attempts to think through the difference of Europe in a rigorous philosophical manner without universalizing the European experience. For Husserl, different cultural (or as he says "spiritual") projects are the result of different attitudes towards the surrounding world, they are not the result of a universal essence of human nature, or of an essence of historical or cultural development. Husserl, thus, prompts us to think the difference between cultural projects and not project a universality based on a specifically European experience. Husserl's project, however, remains problematic both for its philosophical, and more importantly epistemological, underpinnings and for its evaluation of the western cultural project.

In this paper I would like to explore the ways in which Husserl's social theory offers an alternative to social theory which tends towards universalism, at the same time as engaging in a critical reading of Husserl's Vienna Lecture. The object of this essay is to begin to address the possibility of an Husserl inspired or phenomenological analysis and critique of the process of globalization – an analysis which does not presuppose specific categories of cultural or social existence, but rather indicates the cultural and social specificity of the these categories, and thus begins to broaden the scope of what should be considered the effects of globalization – in particular its universalizing tendencies, and its tendency to export the universal, the product of a specific cultural attitude.

Cameron, Jessica (York University, Canada)

jessicac@yorku.ca

Fucking Ourselves to Death: Bataille, Sex, and Art.

This paper explores the use of erotic imagery in the creation of heterogeneous works of art. For Bataille, the heterogeneous is a celebration of the incommensurability of elements through an operation of declassification – it is the proliferation of unknowable difference. We might read heterogeneity onto eroticism in that, for Bataille, eroticism only arises through the transgression of homogeneous prohibition originally established for the purposes of separating us from animal sexuality and its association with excrement and death. If eroticism necessarily involves the transgression of prohibition, might we identify moments of death and the excremental in eroticism? What of representations of the erotic in works of art? Is this how we come to interpret certain works of art as erotic – through a quiet resurfacing of excrement and death? I will explore these questions by looking at pornography and works of art (including my own) for moments of heterogeneity through representations of the erotic.

Campbell, Colin (York University, Canada)

Political Economy and General Economy

colin@yorku.ca

Georges Bataille's concept of 'general economy,' which he develops in the first volume of his book *The Accursed Share*, represents a challenge equally to bourgeois economics and to 'productivist' and/or 'determinist' Marxist reactions to bourgeois economics. However, the very concrete implications of his theory of excess are too often explored merely as aesthetic problems, or are sequestered with 'post-modern' or 'post-structuralist' theories which as often as not seek to make compromises with the bourgeois economic world. This sequestration of Bataille's insight is likely due to his more or less shocking attitude toward violence, which Rene Girard has likened to that of a connoisseur to a valued condiment. I would like to present a paper which outlines Bataille's original contribution to the theory of capitalist politics and economics, and how the problems he offers us throw light on contemporary divisions between 'Marxists,' 'Post-Marxists' and others.

Caruana, John (Ryerson University, Canada)

jcaruana@arts.ryerson.ca

The Discordant Self: On Some of the Enigmas of Conscience

In the wake of the 'death of God,' and the waning of authority in general, what formal structures or agencies can we rely on as our moral compass? Increasingly, people have turned to themselves for such orientation. Consequently, we are left to repeating – at times, ad nauseam – the old adage of 'following one's own conscience.' But what is this thing called 'conscience'? What does it mean to say that the self is against itself? If as its etymology suggests, conscientia involves a witnessing or knowing with, who or what is this incongruent companion of the self? Is it 'in' us or in some sense 'outside' of the self? Is conscience a purely social and historical phenomenon as our genealogists are apt to argue, or is there something irreducible about conscience that escapes the wide and far-reaching net of socialization and historicization? These questions are at the heart of nineteenth and twentieth century European thought: Nietzsche, Freud, Heidegger, Jankélévitch, Levinas, and Ricoeur, to name but a few major authors who have tackled the perplexities of conscience. The object of my paper is to map out some of the fruitful tensions that are at play in the reflections of these thinkers. For all its ambiguity, however, I do want to suggest the importance of emphasizing that conscience, properly speaking, can only ever be properly qualified as 'bad.' There is something profoundly evasive about the idea of a 'good conscience.' Our humanity is sustained by preserving, as opposed to rationalizing or theorizing away, the comfortless and unrelenting discord that is conscience.

Chandler, Mielle (York University, Canada)

mielle@yorku.ca

Democracy, Performance and the Being of Bees

The example of the honey bee hive has, throughout the history of western social and political theory, often been evoked as a phenomenon similar enough to human social and political structure to model either an ideal or a dystopic potentiality. Further, due to the parallels between human and bee communication, the dance of the honey bee, the *apis mellifera*, has posed a challenge to an anthropocentric tendency in western philosophy which ties language to being and posits language-being as exclusively human. Emile Benveniste, who takes up this very question, is concerned to show that the bee dance is not truly performative, and thus cannot be considered language, because it lacks intentionality. The dance of the bee does not say something new but simply reiterates, traces and repeats. In response to Benveniste I draw on Jacques Derrida's formulation of writing as iteration, repetition and difference, as a necessary condition of language, to suggest that it is not language that bees enact, but rather writing. I draw from biologist Thomas Seeley's work to suggest, moreover, that the preoccupation of linguists, biologists and social theorists with the dance of the bees, that is, with the most performative aspect of bee communication, has overlooked a myriad of more subtle and less performative forms of writing such as the building of honeycomb and the regulation of hive temperature. An investigation of this preoccupation, and of the arguments against conceding bees language, elucidates and throws into question a motivating and esteemed tenant of democracy: the manifestation being through performative speech. In *Democracy, Performance and the Being of Bees* I draw from the work of Hannah Arendt to sketch this foundational bias which I then reconfigure by way of Derridian reading of the writing of bees.

Clark, David (McMaster University)

dclark@mcmaster.ca

At Odds with Animals: Philosophical Modernity and the War on Brutes

In a passage from *Toward Perpetual Peace* (1795) Immanuel Kant argues that "primitive" peoples "have enough to do warring against animals, so that they live peaceably among themselves." Out of this militant primal scene, Kant suggests, is born the origin of culture and the cosmopolitan kingdom of ends. But what is "war" – and why war? – and what are "animals" such that they must be treated as combatants in the name of an achieved "peace"? What social and psychic

economies are at work linking the discord between species to an entente among members of one species? My paper addresses the constitutive role that the violent disavowal of non-human life plays in the conception of a reasonable and responsible community. I argue that philosophical modernity is characterized by an ongoing but mostly repressed "war" against animals, or what are imagined to be animals, this, in the name of peace. As the site of a disavowed disavowal, texts that are crucial to the philosophical self-conception of European "humanity" are marked by what I describe as an interminable *anthropological melancholia* vis-à-vis the animal. This work of mourning is expressed in the form of foreclosures and erasures of the dreamed animal, a labour of renunciation whose repetitiveness and whose axiomatic nature puts to us that philosophy cannot have done with animals and *cannot have done with having done with them either*. Engaging recent work by Jacques Derrida on the subtle connections between notions of sacrifice, violence, rationality, and the constitution of the "properly" human, I explore how philosophical conceptions of community in Kant and Levinas are haunted by the blood of animals.

Dang, Baolinh (York University, Canada)

baolinh@yorku.ca

An Antidote for Self Delusion: Madhyamaka, Brain Science, and Phenomenological Experience in the Search for (No)Self

The apodictic certainty of the Cartesian self (*res cogitans*) has become a popular target for academic attack. Widely critiqued, the European Enlightenment model of representational knowledge, often equated with science, operates on epistemological and ontological assumptions that foster an ethos of domination through a host of conceptual bifurcations. The tension between Being and appearance, itself a dualism, having never been adequately resolved in metaphysical thought, engenders other dichotomous structures; among them are realism and idealism, body and mind, thought and action, identity and difference, subject and object, self and other. Taken to its ultimate point, the progress of European enlightenment transforms into its opposite. When the grounds of certainty, either in the rational self or the reality of a mind-independent world begin to rupture, the ego-self is horrified in its confrontation with no-thing-ness.

This paper will argue that the Madhyamaka teachings of No-self provide a radical re-conceptualization of subjectivity. I will attempt to show that the self is both elusive and illusive by inquiring into the experiential structure of perception. To this end, I will draw upon research in the brain sciences, the phenomenology of experience (Bergson, Merleau-Ponty), and the negative dialectics (tetralemma) of Nagarjuna in critiquing the static enlightenment paradigm of knowledge. Although proponents of the cognitive sciences have embraced a version of no-self, this (counterfeit) version still maintains the inherent and essential existence of matter. Madhyamaka goes beyond this to deny even the ultimate existence of the physical. From the practice of nondual awareness, one can begin to make ethical interventions in re-appraising the inborn tendency to reify subject and object, self and other. In place of a discourse on being, Madhyamaka suggests a transformation in being.

Davis, George Vivien (Virginia Tech)

gvdavis@vt.edu

Governing the Spirit of Capitalism: Pastoral Power, Scientific Discourse, and Techniques of the Working Self

This paper critically engages the modern work ethic as a Foucauldian "technique of the self" that provides both a regulative ideal around which modern subjectivity is organized, and acts as a "dividing practice," demarcating normal from abject subjectivities. Drawing from Weber's Protestant Ethic, the first part of this paper investigates how the work ethic operates as a technique of pastoral power, a conduit between God's grace and the Christian subject. From there, I explore the work ethic as a technique of modern, scientific power expressed, primarily, through psychiatric discourse. Psychiatry, I suggest, provides a new form of pastoral authority; the ethos of work and responsibility is no longer merely an expression of spiritual worth, but also of psychic/subjective normality. Problematizing the work ethic in this

way, I argue, reveals its political function: it legitimizes the normal working subject and disqualifies those failing to embrace the cultural ethic of work and responsibility.

Dorman, Arslan (Concordia University, Canada)

adorman@alcor.concordia.ca

The State, Power and Developmentality: Discord in the Periphery

The role of the state in economic and political development of the peripheral countries is a source of controversy in the contemporary political economy debates. On the one side of the debate are neo-liberal developmentalists, who argue that the notion of benevolent, developmental state (advocated by post-Keynesians and/or dependency theorists, who I refer as the structuralists) needs to be discarded altogether. The state needs to shrink back to its 'natural' Smithean state. On the other side are structuralists, who look at the 'East Asian Tigers' that ostensibly thrived on the accepted principles of developmental state. A state that is patriarchal or even dictatorial, but nonetheless benevolent. It is my argument that the debate around the 'developmental' state contained in this literature is incomplete and even obfuscating. It is incomplete because it fails to account for the underlying social struggle that is fought out at the level of the state. It is obfuscating because it conceptualizes power as uniform, mechanical and architectural, ignoring the infinite ways that 'developmentality' penetrates into the lives of 'developing' people and works through them. The paper argues that whereas the incompleteness of theories concerning the role of the state in development requires a recourse to Marxist functionalism applied to the political economy of developing regions, the obfuscating nature of the 'developmental state' discourse needs to be demystified by advancing a theory of 'developmentality' with the aid of Foucault's analysis of power, disciplines and governmentality. Most importantly, the paper suggests that only by bridging Marxist functionalism and Foucaultian critique can one advance a theory of discord in the developing regions.

Dumbrell, Andrea (University of Western Ontario)

adumbrel@uwo.ca

Schiller, Aesthetics and Politics

In the seventeenth century, Europe witnessed the birth of a revolutionary intellectual movement known as the Enlightenment. Friedrich Schiller is but one philosopher of the Enlightenment, whose notion of the "aesthetic" is fundamentally linked to the defining concerns of this period. Upon an examination of his essay Letters on the Aesthetic Education of Man, it is clear that Schiller's notion of the aesthetic is inextricably tied to the characterizing concerns of the Enlightenment. However, at points throughout his essay Schiller's notion of the aesthetic appears to allude to theoretical positions far removed from the intellectual tenets of the Enlightenment. Although Schiller's notion of the aesthetic lies at the heart of the Enlightenment's defining concerns – namely reason, tolerance, and freedom – the same vision of the aesthetic also provides a theoretical basis for philosophies that depart from, and even intrinsically reject the privileging of, these particular ideas. Ultimately, we must evaluate the degree to which Schiller's aesthetic articulates movements like Romanticism, imperialism, and fascism and how legitimately (*particularly* in the case of imperialism and fascism) his philosophy is appropriated by these movements. Is Schiller's text simply a metaphor for more sinister ideologies? Almost certainly not – much as Plato feared, an author retains little control over how his or her texts are interpreted or "misread" by others. Although Schiller's notion of the aesthetic should not be construed as inherently articulating the tenets of Romanticism, imperialism or fascism, it is essential to recognize that the aesthetic faintly but distinctly resonates with all three of these notions.

Friedman, Elisabeth (York University, Canada)

erfriedman@sympatico.ca

Charlotte Salomon: From the Archive to the Art Gallery

During the Nazi era, the young German artist Charlotte Salomon created a singspiel, or "song-play" entitled *Life or Theatre?*, in which she narrates the story of her life, her family, and the German Jewish cultural world that was destroyed in the Holocaust. This work consists of 769 gouache paintings combined with text, and accompanied by music citations. While the work may be considered a musical-theatrical piece, it was not intended to be performed, but rather to be viewed and read. The story is told on several levels, and by various distinct voices, which at times contradict and interrogate each other. Before she was deported to Auschwitz, where she was murdered, Salomon entrusted the work to a family friend. Eventually *Life or Theatre?* was given to the Jewish Historical Museum in Amsterdam, who preserved it in their archives as a historical document of the Nazi era. In recent years, *Life or Theatre?* has been rediscovered as a unique and sophisticated work of art, and was recently on tour in art museums throughout England, Canada and the United States.

While much writing has been done on *Life or Theatre?*, this research has tended to consider it either as an historical document or as a work of art, with little effort to integrate the two. Like other recent representations of the Holocaust, *Life or Theatre?* defies the conventions of genre, and the traditional split between the historical and the imaginative. Because of its many layers, the historical context of its production, and the history of its reception, it invites an inquiry into the relationship among public history, personal expression and the mediating role of art history. But as Van Alphen (1997) suggests, it is precisely the role of gender in the work, and Salomon's aesthetic strategies for narrating the impossibility of the woman artist, and therefore of her own story in the context of the Holocaust, that destabilizes the opposition between history and art history in *Life or Theater?*

Fritsch, Matthias (Concordia University, Canada)

mfritsch@alcor.concordia.ca

Egalitarian Universalism and the Formation of the Demos

A theory of democracy that places emphasis on deliberation rather than aggregation has, among critical social theorists, enjoyed considerable attention over the last two decades. One of the most wide-spread objections to the goal of reasonable consensus by way of procedurally constrained deliberation is that it is not only empirically unlikely to be attained, but intrinsically contradictory. Here I will deal with the argument that the procedural constraint of universal inclusiveness is contradicted by the need for a unified demos, a unity that, due to the differential nature of identity formation, cannot be thought without exclusions. A principled argument of this kind cannot be refuted on the grounds that all historical or present exclusions can be traced to merely empirical factors. Nonetheless, the 'ontopolitical' argument does not already undermine the deliberative democrat's response according to which we can seek to defend those excluded only by presupposing the universality of the norms embodied in the procedural constraints of deliberation.

Grahn, Eric (Queen's University, Canada)

egrhn@ouc.bc.ca

Concord and Discord: The Problem of being-with-Otherness in Contemporary International Relations Theory

Discord does not fit within more contractualist theories of internationalist politics concerned with states in an 'anarchic system' (think the state of nature). These sorts of arguments have been prevalent in the field under the broad rubric of neorealism (in all its forms) and neoliberal institutionalism. Under these theoretical discourses, international phenomena and institutions like regimes, rules, laws, treaties, and organizations are conceived as a coming together based upon atomistic states acting in and through 'agreement.' These agreements rise and fall either by the vicissitudes of power politics or alternatively more liberal accounts focus on the issues of 'disagreement';

misunderstanding; the lack of certainty, information, or lack of benefits that delimit the possibility of cooperation in global politics. Recent approaches to International Relations Theory have begun to discuss issues of being a friend or enemy in understanding issues of cooperation and conflict. What they have failed to note is that there is a deepening of understanding if we move from simple dichotomies of agreement/disagreement to recognizing that there is also politics not just through contract but concord. Concord suggests a deeper sense of fellowship and Discord suggests a much more deeper seated feeling the reaches beyond disagreement. It is interesting to note that Aristotle speaks of concord and the importance of friendship. I was interested in part reviewing the problematic history of current IR theory in terms of concord and discord in terms of being-with. Secondly, how Concord/Discord suggests a new avenue for contemporary International Theory.

Gray, Kevin (University of Toronto)

kevin.gray@utoronto.ca

What Exactly Was It That Bernard Williams Criticized?

Bernard Williams published two famous critiques on utilitarianism: one in *Beyond Utilitarianism* and the other as "A Critique of Utilitarianism" in *Utilitarianism: For and Against*. In them, he outlined his basic objection to utilitarianism: that the theory cannot take into account the strong preferences of individuals and their sense integrity. According to Williams, some ethical dilemmas, the solutions to which are apparent to the utilitarian, cannot be solved in the real world because they impose solutions on the actors which are incongruent with their internal sense of morality.

His famous example, modified slightly, goes like this: Either I kill one prisoner or my captors will kill ten. According to Williams, the moral action (as chosen by the utilitarianism) would be for me to kill one of the other (presumably innocent) prisoners, in order to save the lives of nine innocent prisoners who would otherwise have been killed. Williams argues, however, that this solution fails to take into account my conception of my self as a person who does not kill. According to Williams, utilitarianism makes the demand that my visceral psychological reactions to proposed courses of action have *no bearing on any utilitarian decision*.

In his essay, however, Williams does not present a cogent theory as to what exactly utilitarianism is and instead allows his argument to slip into what would seem to be at first glance a very crude type of consequentialism. I shall examine Williams's conception of utilitarianism to see if his arguments (assuming that they are valid) sound the death knell for utilitarianism or if, by adopting a more sophisticated philosophy, we can avoid Williams's concerns.

Hadj-Moussa, Ratiba (York University, Canada)

rhm@yorku.ca

The Concord Imaginary and the Reality of the Discord

This paper originates from my observation of the Algerian "post" civil war. The promulgation in 1999 of "The Civil Concord Law" aimed at stopping the terrible war that was tearing up Algeria. In parallel to the political and ethical issues that are raised by this law, in particular the ways in which memory is enacted and responsibility processed, we would like to reflect on the term of "concord" itself and its various meanings in the Algerian Arabo-Islamic acception. This reflection takes into consideration a very paradoxical situation in which it was the political regime that was drawing on the fiction of unity and no longer the different segments of the society (considered to be "communitarians") who opposed the Law, and who, among other things, explicitly fought for the recognition of individual responsibility. Some of the questions that we would like to raise here are: Why has this term been chosen rather than others, such as, for example, reconciliation, truth and peace, etc.? Is this choice a re-enactment of the fear that has been continuously present in the Arab-Muslim history, or is it in fact strongly related to the Algerian anthropological grounds and its modern history? Working on these questions will help us to reconsider the issue of discord in a liminal situation where the physical elimination became the dominant expression.

Haynor, Anthony L (Seton Hall University)

leohaynor@aol.com

The War on Essentialism in Social Thought

The paper begins with a sketch of essentialism as a significant if not dominant metaphysical position within the human sciences in the Classical and Medieval traditions, and in a real sense in the Enlightenment tradition as well. The argument put forward is that from an early 21st century vantage point, the continuity from one period to the next lies less in the nature of the human person and human social forms that is posited and presupposed, and more in the fact that the uncovering of this nature was a central concern in each case. The position taken is that an understanding of human action and human society presupposed for most Classical, Medieval and Enlightenment thinkers some notion of a human essence, their substantive differences (both within each of the traditions and between traditions) notwithstanding. It is argued that the rooting of social theory in some conception of a human telos, natural law, or laws of nature has been systematically and increasingly delegitimized in the preponderance of the intellectual community. The position advanced is that this has occurred in two waves, a "one-two" punch so to speak: the first line of attack came from the historicist perspective of Counter-Enlightenment thought, and the second from postmodern social theory. The paper concludes with a discussion of the desirability and prospect of reclaiming the essentialist legacy in social thought in the contemporary age. Two candidates are put forward for consideration in this connection: bio-anthropological theory and Catholic social thought.

Hogan, Trevor (La Trobe University)

T.Hogan@latrobe.edu.au

The State of Social Sciences in Australia: A Survey Essay' commissioned by the Human Capital Committee Social Science Research Council, NY

Australia has always been a peculiar place, since settlement or invasion in 1788. It combines extremes: one of the most urban nations in the world, its cities nestle on the edge of an island continent largely dominated by desert. It is simultaneously Western, more directly British and in turn American, and other, not least because of the founding presence of an aboriginal culture which stretches back forty thousand years. It is at the same time developed and underdeveloped, central and yet peripheral, increasingly more like North America and yet historically closer in experience to South America. It has a long and ambivalent relationship with New Zealand/Aotearoa, across the Tasman; earlier, the two used to be referred to as Australasia, and New Zealand was a hundred years ago touted as a possible partner to Australian Federation. Australia is plainly the result of colonial activity, since its penal inception by Britain in the eighteenth century; and yet like other such cases, it also generates its own culture, combining vernacular with dominant imperial cultures and anything else obvious that comes to mind and hand.

And so it is with social sciences, in Australia, which often bear the clear imprint of British and American precedents, yet have something else to offer besides: first, as a horizon of reflection for metropolitan social sciences (e.g., Durkheim); second, as a source of expatriate social scientists (earlier, e.g. Hancock; V.G.Childe, Mayo); third, as a site of indigenous innovation using classical traditions and methods in social sciences (e.g., Aboriginal ethnography; community, class and stratification studies); and in recent decades, as the antipodean crossroads of cultural and intellectual trafficking in social sciences. In each of these phases and practices, social sciences in Australia have their own achievements, mainly those established through the state-based university system and its expansion after World War Two. At the same time, given the present state of change, it is now increasingly difficult to characterise the situation in Australia, which seems far more volatile than elsewhere in the centres, though it may parallel rates of change in more transitional cases. For universities have been the specific objects of political change or social engineering for the last twenty years now, first at the hands of the Australian Labor Party, now the Liberal Party (Conservatives). In the process, the universities have become institutions dominated by vocational, instrumental and managerialist cultures.

This survey brief begins with an overview, followed by a section on the disciplines. A case study of our own university, La Trobe, follows, as an indicator of some of the characteristics, changes and challenges facing social sciences in Australia today. The next section addresses publics, publishers, think tanks, academics, and other institutions. Concluding observations close the brief. This is a view from La Trobe, a sixties university originally built with a liberal arts agenda, and it is a view from a Sociology Department which once claimed to be the largest and most influential in the southern hemisphere. This brief does not claim to be comprehensive; it merely attempts to survey some issues and context by way of a mapping exercise.

Hostaker, Roar (Lillehammer University College)

roar.hostaker@hil.no

Gabriel Tarde and the Ontology of the Social

Gabriel Tarde (1843 - 1904) is one of the 'lost' founders of the social sciences. However, recent re-editions of his major works should signify an increasing interest in his work. In what ways is his work relevant for contemporary social theory? The major aim of this paper is to discuss some of the contemporary actualizations of Tardes work, especially in relation to his *Psychologie Economique*. This book where Tarde analyzes the political economy of his day, is especially relevant in contemporary discussions about post-fordism or cognitive capitalism. The emphasis given by Tarde to inventions as the basis for the wealth of nations de-centers the economic field away from homogeneous reproduction. This opens for a reevaluation of the ontological status of the social and a movement towards a genuine understanding of difference.

Isin, Engin (York University, Canada)

isin@yorku.ca

City of Discord

The city of discord represented the orient for occidental thought; or, rather, the occident represented itself as the city of accord: contract, unity, association, which the city of discord lacked. The game is over. Now, representing itself as city of discord what is thought to do without its other? Will it indeed open itself up and recognize the other not as the other but another? Or will it reconstruct itself as another other as the mirror image of itself?

Juetten, Timo (University of Sussex, UK)

t.juetten@sussex.ac.uk

Bauman & the Frankfurt School on the Holocaust

The paper compares Zygmunt Bauman's work on Modernity and the Holocaust with the writings of Adorno and Horkheimer on this topic. It contrasts the Frankfurt School's thought with that of Bauman along three angles of investigation: Enlightenment, modernity, and civilisation. It argues that while the accounts overlap in many respects, important differences exist. While Bauman sees the Holocaust as an outcome that defines modernity as much as modernity's achievements, for the Frankfurt School, the Holocaust is caused by irrational forces that underlie one-sidedly rationalised societies. Thus, the Frankfurt School's account is more specifically tied to their critique of capitalism, while for Bauman the mode of production is less relevant. A major issue in both accounts is the inability of modernity to cope with undecidability in the (non-) recognition of otherness. The paper will elaborate on this problematic.

Kang, K D (University of Brighton, UK)

doc8808@yahoo.co.kr

'Overdetermination': Some Reflections on Balibar's Recent Work

The question which haunts Althusserian Marxism is whether it can theorise structure and contradiction at the same time. The dual formulation of 'overdetermination' and 'determination in the last instance' was adopted by Althusser and Balibar to resolve this problem. The thesis of 'determination in the last instance', which they adopted as a demarcation line of materialism, failed to provide a clear demarcation from economism, and ultimately revealed a teleology even in Structuralist Marxism's understanding of historical development. In order to get over this limit, Balibar now suggests overdetermination as the demarcation line between materialism and idealism, and tries to redefine the notion of matter as immanent causality.

Balibar's current project for the transformation of Marxism is as distinctive as was that of Althusser in the 1960s, to which Balibar himself contributed. In similar fashion, it both contains many ruptures with earlier positions, and it owes a considerable debt to the work of Spinoza.

This is especially the case with Balibar's self-criticism in many of his works from the period commencing in 1980. The theoretical theses he proposes (the dialectics of tendency/counter tendency, the dialectics of the masses and classes, criticism of the concept of the last instance, etc.) are designed to radicalize the transformation of Marxism upon which he first embarked with Althusser, and at the same time to confirm the differences between orthodox Marxist and Althusserian positions. In his posthumous works, Althusser also struggled to reformulate Marxism and Materialism. This does not imply, however, that either of them break with Marxism, and move towards anti or non-Marxist positions. Though their Later works tend to have some post-Marxist elements, these are analytically distinct from Post-Marxist positions, as such. Thus Balibar's recent project is not the abandonment of Marxism but is rather an attempt to extend its denotation.

Mainly focusing on the recent works of Balibar, this paper touches on what is definitive of Althusserian Materialism, and what it poses against orthodox Marxism in criticizing the notion of economic determination in the last instance

Kelly, Colm J. (St. Thomas University)

kelly@stu.ca

Discordant Tones of Enlightenment

Discord would have a certain relationship to tone. It would involve an unsettled tone; it would unsettle the proper tone. Conflict is in the open; it can be brought into the light of day; it can be pursued, analyzed and resolved. Discord seems more akin to hitting a false note; a shift in tone, a difference in tone. Such a difference is resistant to analysis; we might say resistant to the light of enlightenment.

I propose that a good social theory must be attuned to differences in tone, the discordant tone and the tonal difference which stops short of discord, and which leaves open the route ahead, whether towards discord or a different relation to the other, the other tone and the tone of the other.

What difference in tone results when a practice that is part of the phenomenon to be analyzed already repeats and analyzes the analysis which would be directed at it? How do we analyze a literary work or a work of art which repeats back to us our own analysis; which already has our analysis folded into it? And particularly, when it repeats back to us with a changed tone our claim to enlighten and illuminate it with our analysis? How can we analyze and respond to the tone of what I call this projective fold? Especially when the tone of this projective fold threatens to invade the whole space of social theory and its claim to enlighten us? Do we analyse this fold or do we respond with a shift in tone of our own, perhaps allowing it to wash over us like a wave? Are these possibilities mutually exclusive or mutually required?

Issues of this kind will be addressed in a relation to a number of literary and musical works, especially the following: "The Rise of Capitalism," by Donald Barthelemy, which as the name implies, ironically folds an analysis of capitalism into a laconic and almost parodic literary fiction; and "Soliloquy", by Scott Johnson, as performed by the Kronos Quartet.

This piece samples an excerpt from a speech by the noted U.S. journalist I.F. Stone, in which Stone defends the values of universality against those of barbarism and tribalism. The sampled speech is electronically altered through multiple repetition of key phrases, and is accompanied by Johnson's composition, in the style of a classical string quartet. [A recording of this piece will be played during my talk.] Analysis will focus on the tonal differences between these works and how my tone and my analysis can respond to them and to this difference. Theoretical references may include Chomsky and Derrida, and perhaps Adorno and Benjamin.

Kenny, Erin (University of Kentucky)

ekenn2@yahoo.com

Return Migrants and Strategic Identity On the Periphery of West African Conflict Zones: Old and New Forms of Personhood in Haute Guinée

Despite recent xenophobic violence in neighboring Ivory Coast, Liberia, and Sierra Leone, the Malinké-speaking region of Guinea remains remarkably stable and peaceful. This paper examines strategic identity discourses among return migrants in Kankan, Guinea collected during a year of anthropological fieldwork. Rather than highlighting rigid issues of autochthony, the Malinké of Haute Guinée postulate an inclusive blend of nationalist pride that relies on a shared, inter-ethnic history of hero figures and resistance to colonialism. As Guinean returnees define, create, and alter existing concepts of traditional history and kin-group affiliation, they mobilize new forms of personhood based on symbolic capital gathered abroad, including foreign-born children. Labeling these second-generation citizens is problematic as they may be slipped conveniently under the rubric of "refugee," foregrounding the nation-state's anxieties about non-normative "stateless-ness." Returnees and their children, as social actors, employ various identities culled from the flexibility of the West African family and their own economic successes abroad.

Kilic, Ayta (University of Winnipeg)

a.kilic@uwinnipeg.ca

Building on Similarities: Transmodernist Approach in the Analysis of a Transnational Conflict

This proposed paper aims to develop a transmodernist model in understanding the relationship between the constructed worlds of "Islam" and the "West". The paper will start with a critical analysis of the modernist and post-modernist views. Main argument of this section is that modernism and post-modernism are, both, built on the assumption of an inherent conflict between *Islam* and the *West* and both provide linear explanations and solutions to this conflict. The presumed "inherent conflict" between the "two worlds" in modern and post-modern interpretations of chaos augurs an perpetual clash of civilizations which leads to either segregation or destruction. Transmodernism, on the other hand, focuses on the similarities rather than differences and offers a non-linear analysis of the West- East relationship. The Transmodernist view considers the globe as one complex system with an ability to create a new order out of chaos by building on similarities.

In the second part of the paper, transmodernist concept of *university* (unity within diversity) will be employed to challenge the fiction of uniform *Western* or *Islamic* identities that are intrinsically in contradiction with each other. It will further be argued that turbulence in the East-West relationship is not a norm but an anomaly. This section will utilize the Coupled Oscillation theory to argue that the intrinsic contradiction of oscillation keeps the harmony between the parties and regulates the functioning of the system, enduring a *peaceful co-existence* or *Dar-ul-Suth*. Any imbalance on the relative pace of the parties' interrupts the harmony and triggers chaos. It is during this process that identity and religion are used as simplified messages, antithetical symbols by the parties involved. At this stage of chaos, the transmodern approach can help to create a new order based on a new paradigm of a *planetary culture* what is once called "*global convivencia*".

Kim, Nakjung (York University, Canada)

humas@yorku.ca

Why Do We Have to Return to the "Subject"?: Karel Kosik's and Enzo Paci's Criticism of the Reductionism of the Official Marx-Leninism.

This paper aims at explaining why Kosik, Svitak, Sartre, Paci, and Husserl declared a slogan, "returning to subject: Man (or, subjectivity)" by demonstrating the implications of the lost of the subject in the Czechoslovakian context. In addition, my paper intends to clarify how Kosik and other phenomenological Marxists tried to overcome the reductionism of the official Marx-Leninism by borrowing Husserl's insightful criticism of the naturalism of natural science. In order to answer to these questions I will attempt to the reason why Kosik developed an interest in "the philosophy of Man" after he experienced socialism in Czechoslovakia. Secondly, I will examine the Czech Questions at three levels: international, domestic, and personal in order to explain the implication of the lost of the subject in Czechoslovakian context. Thirdly, I will show how Kosik and Svitak explain the causes of the crisis of Czechoslovakia throughout the history of process of Sovietization of Czechoslovakia. Next, I will show Kosik's five main criticisms of the official Marx-Leninism. Then I will outline the background of phenomenological Marxism and the relationship between Husserl and Masaryk. Finally, I will show how Enzo Paci tries to materialize Husserl's phenomenology in order to combine Marxism and Husserl's philosophy.

King, Matthew (York University, Canada)

making@yorku.ca

To Whom Does the Critic Write?: Habermas and Foucault on Universalism, Partisanship, and Foundations

Habermas charges that Foucault's work is guilty of the "arbitrary partisanship of a criticism that cannot account for its normative foundations." I argue that responses to this charge appealing to an abstract anti-foundationalism miss its significance. Habermas's challenge is not merely an abstraction aimed at showing that Foucauldian political criticism fails to be properly systematic. Rather, in Habermas's view, political criticism must be rooted in the right kind of foundations in order to be convincing in the actual world of political discourse; if it is not so rooted, criticism will be either useless or reliant on an ultimately self-defeating strategic manipulation of its audience.

To demonstrate what is required by Habermas, I explicate the foundation underlying his own political critique, and show how it entails an imperative to make criticism universally convincing. I further show how Habermas's distinction between the moral and the ethical is crucial to understanding his conception of normative foundations. Since Foucault is unsympathetic to the project of morality as Habermas conceives it, Foucauldian criticism is necessarily partisan, as indeed Foucault says himself: his work is for the benefit of those engaged in struggle.

On the other hand, it is evident that his work can make the struggle more difficult for those whose side one expects Foucault to take. Thus while Foucauldian criticism is partisan, it is not primarily motivated strategically (in Habermas's sense) to advance the practical interests of a certain party. Foucault does seek to convince rather than manipulate his audience. Where he departs from Habermas is in refusing the requirement that one's audience consist of the entire universe of rational persons. However, I suggest that neither Habermas nor anyone else could satisfy this requirement absolutely. Thus the question for the critic is: who comprises the community I write to convince?

Kleinrichert, Denise (University of South Florida)

kleinrichert@ij.net

Social Responsibility of What?

An Analysis of the Critique of Enlightenment and Social Responsibility

The proposition that the written word is tangential to music may be applied to the critique of enlightenment as the precursor for the notion of social responsibility to illustrate the fallacy of the final form of reason, or the negation of the continuity of history. The vicissitude of the Hegelian notion of self-consciousness, the formulation for early Marxist

thought, lends a regressive look at the Age of Reason in an *excursion* into the excursion of a revelation of the dialectic of enlightenment. Thus, a similar course in the contemporary determination of social responsibility as an end to history is posited. A *theory of moral unity*, the notion of a synthesis of ethical, social, and economic values, in applying ethical standards of society's expectations provides a dialectical course for action. As such, just as music has the resonance of form and content, the sense of social responsibility in contemporary word-speak follows closely in the same mythical evocations. In this paper, I will argue that the notion of social responsibility fails to respond to the primal quest, "What?"

Klement, Kristine (York University, Canada)

kklement@yorku.ca

Masochism and Identification: Queer Attachments to Subjection

In this paper I ask the question what attaches us to our identities? Foucauldian social theory suggests that all identities are socially constructed and that it is through our identities that we are situated in systems of power. The Foucauldian subject is a product of the social and political forces which shape his/her identities, however the status of the thinking and feeling subject and their role in navigating these identities is left largely untheorized. If queer identities are not marked on the body, but only take hold of us when we take hold of them, then what is it that makes us take them on? And if certain identities are abject, considered socially undesirable or even unlivable, then how is it that we come to inhabit them?

Some psychoanalytic theories attempt to explain women's attachment to domination as a form of masochism (see Deutch (1930), Reich (1940), Benjamin (1988)). By applying a Foucauldian understanding of power to Deleuze's (1989) psychoanalytic theory of masochism, I offer a rereading of masochism as a psychical and social process involved in gender and sexual identification. Reading queer identities through this theory, I argue that masochism offers a particular configuration of subjectivity in relation to power and pleasure that is compatible with both the Foucauldian theory of power and the psychoanalytic subject.

Kroker, Arthur (University of Victoria, Canada)

Dept. of Political Science, University of Victoria, PO Box 3050 STN CSC Victoria, BC. V8W 3P5

Streamed Capitalism, Cynical Data and Hyper-Nihilism

Marx, Heidegger and Nietzsche provide a comprehensive, critical and futurist account of the destiny of technology as nihilism: its origins, implications, and its historical method of realization. Marx, the theorist of the political economy of technology, relates in precise detail how the industrial stage of capitalism will give rise to capitalism as a "pure circuit of circulation"—streamed capitalism. Nietzsche, the poet of technology, diagnoses a century in advance the invidious growth of suicidal nihilism as the cultural sign of technological society. Heidegger, the metaphysician of technology, deepens our understanding of the mythic origins of technology to include a critical reflection on the meaning of technicity in relationship to the more fundamental question of being.

Marx, Heidegger and Nietzsche are futurists of the culture of nihilism as the essence of 21st century politics.

Kurasawa, Fuyuki (York University, Canada)

fk307@nyu.edu

Alternative Globalization and the Practice of Cosmopolitan Solidarity

The paper takes as its premise a gradual shift in critical discourse, over the past decade, from the politics of difference to the creation of global solidarity. However, I begin by criticizing the socially 'thin,' formalist and proceduralist conceptions of transnational solidarity that predominate in the burgeoning literature on cosmopolitanism. The second part of the paper proposes a thicker understanding of cosmopolitan solidarity that interprets the latter as a form of normatively and politically driven social action seeking to articulate the principles of difference and equality in the construction of social bonds with distant others. I will illustrate this point with reference to the alternative

globalization or so-called 'anti-globalization' movement, whose solidaristic politics are based upon acknowledgement of overlapping challenges and situations while attempting to eschew the traps of radical particularism (or othering), on the one hand, and false universalism (or sameness), on the other.

Langer, Beryl A. (LaTrobe University, Australia)

B.Langer@latrobe.edu.au

Consuming Childhood

The paper explores the shifting relation between children, money and 'the sacred' associated with what Bauman has called the 'Great Separation Mark Two'. Signs that 'childhood' no longer occupies an uncontested place in the domain of the 'sacred' are all around us. What do they mean? One way of understanding this shift is in terms of Zelizer's (1985:213) thesis that 'the relationship between the market and noneconomic value is not static', developed in relation to the expulsion of children from production in the United States at the beginning of the twentieth century. Zelizer uses the location of children in the realm of the 'sacred' to demonstrate 'the independent effect of cultural factors' on 'the market'. She argues that 'the power of the market has been over-estimated', and that 'the "commercialization effect" has its precise counterpart -- a reciprocal "sacralization" process by which value shapes price, investing it with social, religious, or sentimental meaning' (Zelizer, 1985:21). Drawing on the same logic, we can see the 'commercialization of children's lives over the past quarter century as evidence of 'the independent effect of cultural factors' which have relocated 'the market' itself in the realm of 'the sacred'. The argument that 'the market' is constrained and limited by 'culture' must take account of the way in which the 'market' is itself culturally constituted, and constituting.

Lepofsky, Jon (University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill)

lepofsky@email.unc.edu

Strange Exchange: Notes From a Local Currency

This paper stems from on-going research conducted alongside participants in a local currency initiative in central North Carolina, USA. A central goal of this initiative is to build community through the development of an alternative regional imaginary and new networks of economic circuits. As an economic intervention based on the movement of money, this initiative potentially transcends the limitations of conventional community-building and the naive pursuit of concord, harmony, and identification through the production of similarity. Indeed, this type of community building, and the community it portends to build, needs strangers to exist as part of the community. This paper explores how this initiative relies on the production of strangers as part of its community-building strategies precisely because how it is structured around certain modes of exchange between strangers. This paper explores this production of strangers as a site of ethical engagement more than simply a technology of othering and exclusion.

Levant, Alex (York University, Canada)

alevant@yorku.ca

Rethinking Spontaneity: Re-reading Luxemburg through Benjamin

The relationship between spontaneity and conscious control has been central to the question of political organization since the beginning of the international workers' movement, and continues to figure prominently in debates over strategy and tactics in the anti-capitalist movement today. Consider the debates between the Bolsheviks and Mensheviks, Luxemburg's polemics against Lenin, Lukacs' critique of Bernstein and Luxemburg, Lenin's struggle with ultra-leftism, Gramsci's critique of social democracy and anarchism as economicist, to name but a few. Furthermore, consider the contemporary turn away from "traditional" party and state-focused approaches in the work of the most prominent commentators on the global justice movement (see Brecher, Klein, etc.), as well as the recent emergence of Open Marxism. Despite the vast differences between their approaches, these thinkers tend to understand spontaneity as something that happens...well, spontaneously, i.e. without conscious planning. Rather than engaging in these

debates, the aim of this paper is to interrogate their terrain by demystifying the concept of spontaneity. Using the work of Gramsci, and a reading of Luxemburg through Benjamin, I attempt to understand where spontaneity comes from, why it appears to arise spontaneously, what its significance is for the anti-capitalist movement, and the impact of this re-conceptualisation on the question of political organization today.

Luke, Timothy W. (Virginia Tech)

twluke@vt.edu

Floundering in the Fields of Freedom: Governmentality as Conducting the Conduct of 'Freedom from', 'Freedom to,' or 'Freedom through' in Contemporary Global Spaces

This paper explores the ambivalent implications of governmentality, as a set of multiform practices of command and control, in renegotiating individual agency amidst flexible assemblies of people and things in the contemporary spatial organization of economic production, political activity, and social order. In some ways, governmentality defines the boundaries of a modernized "human" existence, creating collective 'freedoms through' governmentality practices. In other ways, it limits individual 'freedoms to' behave in many manners via governmentalizing definitions of the conduct of conduct. And, in some other ways, it impedes certain checks upon collectives that could guarantee individuals various other 'freedoms from' subjection to technological, social, political, and economic controls. This paper reexamines these interlocked contradictions, seeking to disclose the utility of Foucault's notions of governmentality for renegotiating how personal subjectivity and social norms actually operate in contemporary everyday life. How people and things coexist in modern spatial formations, and then how things mediate the effects of governmentality in such techno-economic systems, will provide the background for re-examining some instances of renegotiating their 'freedoms' as individuals flounder amidst the many fields of freedom that modernity constitutes.

Marder, Michael (York University, Canada)

misham@yorku.ca

The Longest Breath There Is: Levinasian Philosophy of Breathing

The notion of breathing traverses the corpus of Levinasian philosophy. Various themes central to Levinas's theory of ethics that are concentrated in this trope include immediacy and materiality, corporeality and transcendence, the other in the same and exposure to the other. Yet, up to date, relatively little has been said on the significance of breathing for the philosophy that utilizes it--a theoretical oversight that I begin to address through an explication of the Levinasian "philosophy of breathing". In Part (1) of this paper I outline the structure of breathing in terms of expiration without inspiration, inspiration without expiration, and the excluded, but irreducible, middle (aspiration) between these two moments. I take up the enigmatic expression "breathlessness of spirit", which both constitutes and transcends the general structure of breathing, in Part (2) of the essay. In Part (3) I consider the implications of the extreme situation of breath as breathlessness for justice and for the justice-ethics interface.

McCourt, Matt (University of Kentucky)

Theory and Practice at the Scene of Collaboration and Community-Based Research in the East Kentucky Coalfields

This paper draws on several years of community-university collaborative work in Harlan County, Kentucky. Part of a larger research project that attempts to explicate local organizers' theories and practices (i.e., embracing a shift to something other than oppositional struggle, an open-ended future orientation, a holistic account of community life--counteracting expert accounts--a persistent ethics of hospitality, and a host of other critical-theoretical moments), this paper concentrates on insider/outsider problems, knowledges, and identities that resurface in community-based research encounters. It situates the issue of insiders and outsiders in the context of Harlan's prior traumatic interventions and delineates the entrenchments and possibilities that the insider/outsider difference enables.

McMurtry, John-Justin (York University, Canada)

jmcmurtr@yorku.ca

The Life Aporia of Marxian Theory

Social theory's radical branches often locate their lineage in Marx or the Marxian tradition. While these various streams of social theory are almost always critical of their theoretical genetics, there is one question that remains almost completely unasked even by the theorists of the Life-World -- is there a life-aporia within Marx and the Marxian tradition. That is, does Marx overlook the moral, socio-economic and political ground of life itself in his scientific analysis of capital and human history? This paper will argue that as Marx's work progresses from the *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts* through to *Capital* there is a fundamental shift away from the critique of existing conditions from the ground of actually existing life to a ever more science/machinal fetish of the productive power of capitalism. It is this later acceptance of machine/science over life that has coloured radical social theory since, and one which must be overcome if Marx's original, powerful and inspiring envisioning of a liberated socio-economic order is ever to be realized.

Meeks, John L (De La Salle Institute, Philippines)

abbau2kx@netscape.net

Makarios: The Body at a point of Revaluation

One of the more interesting aspects of social theory has been the view of the history of the human body as less a history of representations and more a history of its various productions. Along these lines it is possible to read texts as diverse as L'Usage des plaisirs (Foucault) and Mythé et société en Grèce ancienne (Vernant). These and other readings of the human body offer more than glimpses into successive discourses concerning the body and at their best view this last at junctures of revaluation. With this last in mind, I would like to offer a reading of the term "makarios" (blessed or fortunate) in the Gospel of Luke as a point in which the constitution of the bodies of the divine and heroes of ancient Greece becomes inscribed within a new or nascent normativity and as a resistance to what was perceived as imperial culture. In Luke we see the revaluation of very term that was used to describe the plenitude of both the divine, a plenitude ascribed not only in the religious ideology of the day but in the political ideology of the emperor, and the hero. In Luke's hand, this plenitude becomes a valorization of what, from the perspective of Greek mythos, could only be limitation and disfiguration ending without a panta kala (beautiful death). In his use of "makarios" Luke dissociates the body from the economy of resentment and the ritualistic strategies in which denial of everyday life is the point of departure for constructing a "purified body". As I hope to show, for Luke the body the plenitude of the body is no longer expressed in warfare, strength and agility but in a communal poesis of feeding the poor, caring for the sick, etc.

Moore, Duston (Indiana University/ Purdue University Fort Wayne)

Moored@ipfw.edu

Universals and Eternal Objects: The Social Philosophy and H. Marcuse and A. N. Whitehead

Social theory advances through alternative speculative metaphysical insights that allow for social criticism; the *not yet* critiques the *as it is*. Unlike the metaphysical nihilism of pure deconstruction, social critical theory advances *provisional* metaphysics. This *provisional* realism means that universals, far from being an illusion of context, are the creativity of a context and the *sine qua non* of actuality, both individual and social.

The philosophies of Marcuse and Whitehead deal with the relation between universals and a social critical theory. Both Marcuse and Whitehead have had a profound influence within their respective scholarly domains. Yet there exists an as yet unexplored point of intersection between these two thinkers. In *Eros and Civilisation*, as well in *One Dimensional Man*, Marcuse cites Whitehead at pivotal points in these texts' development. This paper examines this

textual connection, establishes the philosophical importance, and addresses how certain issues in Marcuse, such as narcissism, can be addressed given a deeper Whiteheadian background.

Mortimer, Lorraine (Latrobe University)

L.Mortimer@latrobe.edu.au

Cinéma Sans Frontières?: Edgar Morin's *The Cinema or the Imaginary Man*

Morin has noted that *Le Cinéma ou l'homme imaginaire* appeared as a strange object of doubtful origins. It spoke of cinema, but not of its art or industry; it described itself as an essay in anthropology, but did not grow out of what was recognized as anthropological science; and it was not a sociology of the cinema. His attempt to consider cinema in the light of anthropology and the *anthropos* in the light of cinema had to be strange, bizarre and confusing to 'the good cinephile, the good anthropologist, the good sociologist'. However he considered cinema as a privileged object for a serious anthropo-sociology. For Morin, the 'obscure obviousness' of the cinema was entwined with our own human substance, itself obvious and obscure – and shared. In cinema the 'nomads of Iran, the children of China' joined French scholars and aestheticians in a participation and understanding that was 'if not the same, at least common'. This paper examines Morin's essay and relates it to more recent theoretical work on transcultural cinema, ways of knowing and the phenomenon of the human.

Muller, Hans-Peter (Institut für Sozialwissenschaften der Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin)

hans-peter.mueller@sowi.hu-berlin.de

Theorizing Capitalism

Capitalism is with us since 250 years and after the demise of socialism bound to stay. But which capitalism? And how can capitalism be established which is a sustainable form of economy, polity and society? Will there be one form of capitalism or several? And if so, how do they look like and how can they be conceptualized? One answer to this set of questions is given by the research on the "varieties of capitalism". The paper draws upon this type of research and tries to formulate consequences for social theory.

Murphy, Peter (Victoria University of Wellington) and **Trevor Hogan** (La Trobe University)

T.Hogan@latrobe.edu.au, Peter.Murphy@vuw.ac.nz

Discordant Order in the New Urbanism of Asia-Pacific Cities

All cities have order, otherwise they are unlivable. But there are degrees and kinds of order. The public spaces of many Asia-Pacific cities have a discordant or even chaotic kind of order. Patterns are present, but these often are ad hoc or ill-defined. The paper examines the case of Manila. We look at the high value placed on interior order, and the pervasiveness of gates that demarcate internal order (in all sectors of Manila society) from the public condition of 'close-to-chaos'. The paper argues that Manila has a type of 'slot' or 'pocket' order that in the second half of the 20th century substantially replaced Spanish-religious and American-official efforts at public space creation. We ask how and why this gated 'pocket' order arose, and explore Spanish, American, Sino-Japanese, and other precedents for it—and the role of the dictatorship in consolidating it. The paper asks are there models in other Asia-Pacific cities for more successful public space creation in the last 50 years? The paper, lastly, reflects on the implications of this analysis for social theoretical models of order creation.

Natter, Wolfgang (University of Kentucky)

wnatter@uky.edu

Expert Knowledge, Civic Professionalism, and Global Regional Participatory Research

Under the banner of globalization from below, alternative models to corporate globalization have suggested the need to rethink the function of the university and the roles and practices of academic scholars in producing and deploying

expert knowledge. One such alternative model has suggested the value of seeking durable forms enabling partnerships between community based scholars and their organizations and civic professionally-minded academics capable of re-circuiting the production and deployment of expert knowledge toward the goals of participatory research and democratic planning. The presentation raises questions about this model, asking 1) what new forms of civil society and academic/community/government partnership might support such aims, 2) what might it mean to attempt a scaling up of community based development, and 3) what value a global regional approach might offer in considering these issues.

Neimanis, Astrida (York University, Canada)

astrida@sympatico.ca

What is Rhizophenomenology?

Gilles Deleuze claims that phenomenology is simple empiricism, bound to "old" modes of thought and trapped in re-presentation. Phenomenology, he therefore suggests, can only think difference in terms of resemblance to a conceived identity. Deleuze proposes instead a philosophy that can think difference in itself. But is the phenomenological project really so dissonant with Deleuze's "rhizome thought"?

If the cornerstone of the phenomenological method is to seek out the essence that repeats itself in our engagement with any phenomenon, this method must be radically reworked if we take Deleuze's theory of difference and repetition - which illustrates how only difference is truly repeated - seriously. What emerges is a new understanding of "essence" revealed by a philosophical method I call "rhizophenomenology." This creative overlaying of Deleuze's philosophy with existential phenomenology presents a reworking of the phenomenological method that not only brings rhizome thought into a dialogue with phenomenology, but which also imbues the phenomenological method with a new ethics: one that finds difference and otherness as essential to the phenomena it seeks to reveal.

Darren O'Donnell (Toronto writer, director, performance artist, designer and artistic director of Mammalian Diving Reflex)

darreno@sprint.ca, <http://www.mammalian.ca/home.php>

Everybody is my Friend and I am Everybody

Eventually I began to notice a few things: that I loved the discord between myself and others as we stood on the precipice, before we were aware that we were becoming friends and that the more powerful the discomfort, the more painful the awkwardness, the stronger the bond that would eventually develop. I began to look for that tense ugly feeling and I began to seek it out, I began to try to generate it, to sit with it, to hang out in it. I started to come to a nervous conclusion: I think I can become friends with anybody. Then I noticed something else: while with a particular friend a particular kind of humour would settle in my body, I would easily reel out particular witticisms, particular points of view would form, I would look at the world in a particular way - and this particularity would only exist in the presence of this person - without them, I would be someone else.

We will talk about my performance and social art practice, I will demonstrate that we leak in and out of each other, that it's possible to kiss without touching, that discord is a gateway and that intentionally initiating confusion and discomfort leads to new levels of awareness, heightened trust and mutuality. Maybe it's the serotonin, I don't know.

O'Neill, John (York University, Canada)

joneill@yorku.ca

His Majesty The Baby: Ego-mimesis, Narcissism and the Politics of Love

Baudrillard has located the end of politics in the ground zero of "homosexuality" or the relationlessness that Bauman calls "liquid love". Our age is haunted by its loss of the Other displaced in endless melodramas of difference. We are no longer mirrored in our institutions because only our narcissistic self is writ large by them. A close reading of Freud on the politics of love reveals endemic problems of narcissistic authoritarianism and micro-fascism.

Palamarek, Michael (York University, Canada)

mikashy@yorku.ca

The Dismembered Human Condition: Labour, Work, and Action in Hannah Arendt

Hannah Arendt's guarded optimism with respect to the possibilities of reconstituting a politically involved public continues to resonate even under contemporary conditions of advanced capitalism and the global war on terror. Her close analyses of the violent failures of twentieth century revolutions serve both as important cautionary tales and as filaments of hope that things could be otherwise. This hope is seen to reside in a reinvigorated theory of action, which, in its close relation to speech and thought, aims to grasp a kind of rich, phenomenological openness of human life to new and inherently unpredictable possibilities.

As I shall present, Arendt's turn to action-inspired by the Aristotelian notion of praxis-is founded on the strict analytical division between labour, work, and action developed in *The Human Condition*. Whereas action always undertakes 'something new and unforeseen', and is thereby considered the proper province of genuinely human activity, Arendt considers labour to be merely the unreflective, almost rote reproduction of material life. In its instrumentality, repetition, and perishability of its products, labour creates nothing new, but is simply the means for sustaining base existence. As a middle term between action and labour, work teleologically produces the durable and stable objects of 'the human artifice'.

While Arendt's sharp reduction of labour captures something of the dehumanizing conditions of mass labour in modern, capitalist societies, her abdication of the problem of the exploitation and, indeed, alienation of labour as important political concerns results in a theory of politics that is disconnected from struggles over material resources, needs, and distribution. Moreover, the abandonment of labour, alongside the insistence on action and speech, critically anticipates Jürgen Habermas's later linguistic turn in critical theory.

Passera, Mark (Bournemouth Media School)

mpassera@bournemouth.ac.uk

Discord: A Positive Re-appraisal Based on New Media

I wish to address the concept of 'Discord' in relation to 'new media'. 'Discord' in social theory is often predicated on notions of dissonance, dissent and marginalization. Such definitions encourage binary (opposing) ideas of social cohesion, solidarity and consensus.

Consideration of the socially transformative properties of media tends to generate a similar binary. The role of 'old media' as both a positive force (Liberal/Pluralist paradigm) and its corollary denoting a negative impact (Frankfurt School/Critical Social Theory) is well documented.

In this paper I intend to highlight a deep rooted methodological bias within theoretical constructs of 'discord', using the example of new media. Working primarily through recent work by Chantal Mouffe, this paper will argue that a reappraisal of dissent and new media allows conflict and discord to be seen as positive forces; which can be harnessed and utilized in both critical theory and practice.

Payne, Jesse (York University, Canada)

jpayne@yorku.ca

Changing the Rules of Engagement: The Role of Videogames in the Struggle for Social Justice

Videogames are increasingly a site of rapid technological development, artistic tension and ideological struggle.

Since September 11th, both the American military and independent developers have tapped into the hysteria of American nationalism, neo-colonialism and anti-terrorist rhetoric, and have saturated the market with videogames presenting narratives, prescribed identities and performances that reflect the imperialism, the patriarchy, the heteronormativity, the classism, the racism, the ableism, in short, all of the structural violences faced by the oppressed within capitalism.

Videogames have most often been used by the ruling class to reinforce dominant liberal discourses, including binary conceptions of identity, static and pessimistic conceptions of human nature and deterministic accounts of technological and historical progress. Perhaps understandably, few scholars have attempted to theorize how videogames might be used to challenge modes of oppression within capitalism and to foster a collective imagination of how to establish and defend a more just social order.

Raymond Williams and Walter Benjamin provide conceptual tools with which to critically examine the implications of videogames for how people both conceive of themselves and their world and engage with the communication technologies, art and artistic processes through which material conditions are discovered and challenged. As videogames increasingly blur the distinctions and unify the functions of author and audience and enable the authoring-audience to write their own stories about themselves and their world, and experiment with identities, environments and engagements that might destabilize the ideological foundations of capitalism, videogames have begun to escape the grips of the ruling class and their ideas.

Peck, Aaron (York University, Canada)

Bewilderments: "Studio Visit" and "Diorama"

We like the word "bewilderment" a lot, especially how the word "wild" is carefully placed between two states of being, as if there in the middle of the word (or world) is where the wild things are.

Bewilderments is a series of prose digressions. Each instalment meanders around a particular object or site, moving through a series of anecdotes, aphoristic essays, prose poems and stories. In the process each object or site is concurrently analyzed and destabilized. The pieces examine the contiguity and incongruity of language and experience, history and desire, and politics and memory. The first instalment, "Studio Visit," considers movie sets and artist's studios alongside other social spaces such as libraries and airports. The second instalment, "Diorama," considers Daguerre's dioramas, spectacle and social desire. A future instalment, "Oval Portrait," will collaborate with the Vancouver-based photographer, Adam Harrison.

Pimlott, Herbert (Wilfred Laurier University)

hpimlott@wlu.ca

W(h)ither the Party Paper?: The 'Communicative Crisis' of Marxism in the 20th Century

This paper begins from the basis that at least part of the failure of Marxism as a political movement during the course of the 20th century has been the result of its 'communicative crisis'. This crisis has only really begun to be explored by some recent studies of socialism and communication (e.g. J. A. Aune [1994] *Rhetoric and Marxism*; O. Swartz [1999] *Socialism and Communication*), despite the centrality of the 'party paper' in Marxist-Leninist ideology and practice, and the importance of communication more generally to the circulation of ideas. This paper highlights how debates over the 'accessibility' of the party paper and its role as both a means of internal and external communication, of agitation and propaganda, have reoccurred at various intervals since the early 20th century, often in tandem with periods of political crisis.

Poochigian, Donald V. (University of North Dakota)

donald.poochigian@und.nodak.edu

Discord and Concord

Discord occurs because of disjunction, human concurrence being incomplete. Imagining something satisfying the membership conditions of any two classes is always possible. Such a thing is understandable exclusively as a member of one or the other class. Alternatively, it is understandable inclusively as a member of both classes, or separately as a member of a third class. No one understanding being more rational, understanding is preferential by definition. Logic terminates at this point. New elements satisfying membership conditions of reconstituted classes being imaginable,

resolution of disjunction is infinite. Being such, agreement at any point in reductive clarification is accidental, constituting concord. As so, disagreement can reoccur on resolution of any disjunctive occurrence in subsequent reductive clarification. Concurrence in this instance is inconsistent. And although it may occur periodically in an infinite reduction, there need be no coherent pattern of occurrence. Disjunction demarcates logic's limit, resolution of disjunction being normative choice.

Portillo, Eva (York University, Canada)

emp@yorku.ca

Dreaming Home, Finding Home

In this presentation I will explore the relationship between institutionalized feminism (women's studies) and racialized youth cultures.

In their collection Cherrie Moraga and Gloria Anzaldúa explain that "what began as a reaction to the racism of white feminists soon became a positive affirmation of the commitment of women of color to our own feminism" (Moraga and Anzaldúa 1983, xxiii). Three years into my undergraduate degree in women's studies it was this sentiment that led me to seek out women of colour outside academia. Two years after that I came upon the realization that, as Deborah Mindry has pointed to, "the grassroots" "is often invoked by feminist organizers as a 'morally pure terrain innocent of politics'" (2001, p. 1202), while the reality is often quite different. Confused, politically and socially without a home, I continued, and took on a master in women's studies. Now, I feel that I have come full circle. I am beyond the space of dreaming for a home, I am now trying to find it. At this point I agree with Virginia Harris and Trinity Ordonez in that "our legitimate cultures can offer us a great source of strength, but we often find ourselves fighting against that very source" (Harris and Ordonez 1990, 306). I have since come to define my home with an activist group of young Latinas/os. For this presentation I would like to critically interrogate why dreaming of home, from a space of institutionalized feminism, led me away from my own place of safety. In particular, to look at the relationship between institutionalized feminism and racialized youth cultures.

Powers, Thomas (University of Minnesota Duluth)

tpowers@d.umn.edu

Multiculturalism and the Postmodern Politics of Difference

In the United States "multiculturalism" (as it has taken shape in the world of the multicultural education) attempts to fashion a new vision of democracy out of the commitment to fighting unjust discrimination. (This in itself raises many questions related to the basic themes of this conference: can multiculturalism as a unity articulate a positive vision of politics that overcomes the conflict, discord, and mistrust at the heart of the basic assumptions of the fight against discrimination?) In the early 1990s leading writers in the field of multiculturalism discovered the arguments of postmodernist theorists and a very interesting dialogue unfolded. Ultimately, however, the multicultural education theorists backed away. I will summarize the outlines of this development and try to explain both what brought multiculturalism and postmodernism together and what drove them apart.

Rubio, Fernando Dominguez (University of Cambridge)

fd234@cam.ac.uk

Beyond Rorty's Sociological Definition of Knowledge.

In this paper I explore the critique of the representational account of knowledge undertaken by the philosopher Richard Rorty and its relevance for Contemporary Social Theory. Rorty's critique can be summarized in the following words: "Objectivity is a matter of intersubjective consensus among human beings, not of accurate representation of something non-human" *Achieving our Country. Leftist Thought in Twentieth-Century America*. Harvard U.P.: Cambridge Mass, 2001. p.35

Sociologists may welcome this idea since it implies that knowledge is defined in purely social terms. Contrary to this assumption, this paper tries to show that this "sociological definition of knowledge" as intersubjective consensus is fraught with the very same problems it tries to overcome. The paper explores how Rorty's *sociological definition of knowledge* instead of overcoming the unbridgeable gap between subject/object posited by a representational account of knowledge displaces it onto another level, namely, that of the social and the non-social. The paper concludes by claiming that we should retain Rorty's critique of representational epistemology while attempting another alternative to his *sociological definition of knowledge*.

Ruddy, Karen (York University, Canada)

kruddy@yorku.ca

Ethical/Political Subjects: Reflections on Althusser and Caputo

This paper reads Louis Althusser's theory of ideology and social subjectivity against the account of the constitution of the ethical subject of responsibility that underwrites John Caputo's theory of postmodern ethics. I begin by outlining Caputo's tri-partite schema of subjectivation, of the ways one becomes a subject, that he presents in *Against Ethics*. I suggest that because his postmodern ethics refrains from inquiring into why the predominant mode of subjectivation in our society is not the subject of responsibility but the autonomous subject – the "author/subject" – he cannot elucidate the mechanisms by which subjects are constituted in relation to power and not in relation to obligation to the destitute other; nor can he explain the subject's "passionate attachment" to power, to use Judith Butler's term, and hence the subject's refusal to be an ethical subject. Turning to the writings of Althusser, in particular to his now infamous essay "Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses (Notes Towards an Investigation)," I claim that one finds in Althusser a description of subject formation under capitalism that accounts for the social and psychic barriers to the systematic development of the ethics of responsibility to the other that Caputo wishes to elaborate. I attempt to show that Althusser's theory of how social subjects are formed through ideology – through a call that emanates from the voice of state authority and that addresses the subject as a free and constitutive subject so that the subject may freely accept his or her subjection to the ruling ideology – reveals why the primary mode of subjectivation under capitalism is that of the autonomous subject and not the ethical subject of responsibility. I then explore where in Althusser one may find room for radical politics and thus for the emergence of an ethical subject of responsibility to the other. I propose that Althusser's political reading of subjectivity, of how the autonomous subject is formed through a certain subjection to power, reveals that ethics does not precede politics or power, as Caputo's account of postmodern ethics would have us believe. Rather, I suggest that ethics for Althusser is always already a problem of politics and power.

Russill, Chris (Pennsylvania State University)

russill@psu.edu

Foucault, Pragmatism, and Political Activity in a Regulatory America

The paper argues that the tools of critical inquiry developed by Foucault (archaeologies of discourse, genealogies of values, and problematization) are consistent with American pragmatist traditions of socio-political theory while providing improved means for more adequately theorizing involvement and exclusion in contemporary political life. More specifically, this paper a) outlines the general project, aims and requirements of pragmatism as these renegotiate the terms of European social theory, b) recounts what Foucault explicitly read and knew and took from this tradition with special attention to the analysis of power, and c) speculates on the continuing relevance of pragmatism and Foucault's work on governmentality in the American context through reference to the example of climate change. In doing so, it elaborates on Foucault's self-understanding of problematization as a critical practice and attempts to develop notions of "publics" and "responsibility" adequate to contemporary societies characterized by governmentality or complex relations of regulatory power.

Sakhi, Shokoufeh (York University, Canada)

sshokou@yorku.ca

Worker's Unite, You Have More to Lose than Your Mortgage!

This paper is an eminent critique of Marx's conceptualization of the "working class" and "labour power". Interrogating why, to the extent that it has, the capitalist working class since Marx's time has become incorporated within first world capitalism, appropriated its ideology, law, religion, culture, and family relations, I seek to illuminate motivational elements of its historical inadequacy to the tasks envisaged by Marx in *The Communist Manifesto* and *The Poverty of Philosophy*?

I will argue that it is the fundamental feature of workers as a socio-economic class with nothing but their labour power—according to Marx, the basis of their motivation for becoming the agency of the abolishment of the capitalist class system—that is in fact the primary avenue of their structural incorporation; as a class. I suggest that a larger conception of their "interests" than Marx imagined is required

Sandlos, Karyn (York University, Canada)

ksandlos@yorku.ca

AIDS, Aesthetics and the Ethics of Failing to Respond in Time

The AIDS pandemic has raised important questions for education both in terms of how extraordinary losses are collectively mourned and how the work of mourning plays a role in the making of the self (Britzman 1998; Crimp 1990, Gilbert 2003 unpublished dissertation; Silin 1995). In her writing on the strange temporality of knowledge made from psychological reality, Jacqueline Rose orients our thinking about loss as the condition of subjectivity:

It becomes impossible... to regulate the forms of traffic between present, future and past, between the living and the dead. To be a subject... is to be haunted. How could identity free itself – would it still be an identity? – of the traces of those who went before? (2003, 87)

If learning about AIDS is charged with both the ordinary and extraordinary senses of mourning, perhaps it is because educators are encountering the difficult question of how to think about AIDS on shifting terrain: protease inhibitors have slowed the tidal wave of losses in the West and consciousness of AIDS has moved into the global sphere. The ongoing devastating impact of AIDS is well known, yet many who are obligated to teach about the pandemic have never been directly affected by it. For those touched only indirectly by the monumental losses of AIDS, the question for educational inquiries remains, how are we affected by the suffering of others, by losses which we cannot claim as our own? In this paper I will discuss some aesthetic conditions for living with and learning from the losses of AIDS. I use analytic theories of mourning (LaPlanche 1999; Rose 2003) to explore how psychological responses to loss become the condition for grappling with the problem of ethicality. I bring these insights to a reading of the aesthetic strategies of independent filmmaker Beverly Peterson in her 1998 film *The André Show*. At one level, films and videos made by artists create the grounds of recognition by reflecting the stories, losses and fears of lives touched by AIDS. Perhaps more significant for my purposes here, however, are the ways in which media artists comment upon the crisis of social responsibility that continues to surround the pandemic: the individual and collective failure to care in time. Thus the condition of viewing is a strange doubleness: we respond to our own failure to respond. When narrative is made from the fragments of social and psychological breakdown, rather than from attempts to repair the breakdown with moral lessons, the act of witnessing itself becomes susceptible to a profound loss of self-regard. If insight is made belatedly, after the breakdown has occurred, what can it mean to use the knowledge one encounters about AIDS as a question of repair and ethical relations?

Waiting...and Wanting: Pedagogy in the Strange Time of Short Film and Video Presentation

This program of short films and videos was curated for the symposium "Terms of Address: The Pedagogy and Politics of Film and Video Exhibition," which took place at OISE, University of Toronto, in March 2003. The program

offers a curatorial and aesthetic model for the dilemma Sigmund Freud offers to our thinking about pedagogy: learning takes place at a time that is at once too early and too late (LaPlanche and Pontalis 1973, 111). The curator's talk suggests that curating and pedagogy have in common the problem of belatedness: of acting without fully knowing or being able to articulate what one is doing in advance. Problems of content, rhythm, juxtaposition and pacing are used to consider some qualities of pedagogy in the strange time of time-based media art. The following questions will be explored: 1) How are connections developed between overarching themes and individual works in a program? 2) How do curators create points of entry and departure? 3) How are emotional and conceptual trajectories developed across the works? 4) What is the significance of relationships between abstract and content-based work? 5) How is attention sustained or given respite throughout a program? 6) How do curators anticipate audience responses such as boredom and frustration? 7) How do curators notice and make use of the difference between what is anticipated and what takes place in a screening in theorizing a practice?

Schaffer, Scott (Millersville University of Pennsylvania)

scott.schaffer@millersville.edu

Discordant Ethics: Valuing an *ethos* of Fragility

The notion of *discord* carries with it ideas of dissent, diversity, and a lack of harmony in the world. The "dis-" prefix contains a value judgment, one that privileges conformity, similarity, and harmony in a social order. This paper posits that a genuine ethics of freedom is one that requires a discordant element within it.

Discord has as its misunderstood virtue the space within which disparate elements of the same or similar phenomena can come together in some kind of combination that defies or resists normalized expectations. While varieties of social theorizing, ranging from the dialectical materialism of Marx to the fragmentation prevalent in postmodernisms, have attempted to come to terms with discord in a social order, there has rarely been a valorization of discord as a mode of ethical social life.

The experience of discord – the experience of dissonance in oneself, of disagreement, of difference – is one that provides us with the opportunity to rethink our notion of ethics. Rather than attempting to impose a unity upon patterns of everyday conduct, a discordant ethics would be one that creates the space for the engagement of differences, and one that would allow for the ethical life to be lived through works that are potentially discordant yet oriented to the preservation of the possibility of discord for others.

Following from Jean-Paul Sartre's *Conférence à l'Institut Gramsci* lectures, in which Sartre argues that upper-case-E Ethical norms inherited from the past constitute a practico-inert violence upon us, this paper will argue that a genuinely lower-case-e ethical existence is one that resists the inertial qualities of modern social life. A radical ethics in the Sartrean vein requires that we continually develop new notions of practical ethical conduct in the here and now, including forms of conduct that may do violence, whether to ourselves and our ordinary lives or to others that inhabit social-structural spaces that perpetuate larger forms of violence to others.

In the essential human quest for practiced forms of freedom, this version of ethics is one that creates a social order experienced as fragile; inertial modes of conduct and patterns of social life that are no longer useful can be resisted, and new modes of conduct beneficial to all can be developed. In other words, a radical ethics on this line would be one of the *peut-être*, the *possible*: to borrow from Corcuff's *La société de verre: Pour une éthique de la fragilité*, *Le peut-être apparaît également partagé entre l'inquiétude et l'apaisement. Inquiétude du pari-la Barbarie peut gagner – qui préserve toutefois la possibilité de moments d'insouciance remontant de l'enfance dans la fraîcheur muette des tonnelles ombragées. Le temps apaisé incarne l'horizon utopique, l'inquiétude le chemin infiniment recommencé qui y conduit.* (254)

Ultimately, this paper argues that the key to living an ethical social existence is to embark on the path of fragility, one that enables us to be truly self-determining and to radicalize the ways in which we coexist with others. The alternative – being told how to live by the ghosts of our grandparents, and the ethical relics of categorical imperatives gone horribly awry – is shown to be much less fruitful for humankind.

Shaw, Christine (Artist, Curator; York University, Canada)

cshaw@yorku.ca

Intuition Is (or Isn't?)...

This presentation will traverse the field of my collaborative curatorial projects; a praxis built upon building a network of cooperative communities: communities of location, locution, love, longing, leaning, learning... Informed by the theoretical (visceral? experimental?) inquiries of Deleuze, Nancy and Agamben, I will engage us in a series of questions such as: If not WHY?, then HOW? If the multiple is not only what has many parts but what is folded in many ways, how might we, how do we, begin to fold? Are we always folding, unfolding, refolding? Is this the structure of experience? If so, then how do we traverse the chaos of the fold? What happens if we do it? How do we build (fold?) communities of and in movement? Who is the WE in we, the US in us? How do we love and trust within this community?

Intuition drives me and my questions towards a few figures or maps for creative praxis: spider webs, emergent ellipses, gelatinous architectures, desiring machines, adrenaline rushes... As I proceed I take cues (imperatives?) for movement and experimentation from Brian Massumi's Parables for the Virtual: ... *move... feel... fold... pass into... Solidify?... Fluidify... Emergences emerge... Changing changes... The intensity is experience... Invention requires experimentation... Open systems... See what happens... Follow the new growth... Incipient systems... Creative contagion... Take joy in your digressions...*

Specifically, I want to share with you a PUBLIC presentation of a private collaboration I am engaged in with Hadley Howes and Maxwell Stephens from Vancouver. Hadley and Maxwell collaborated, collaboratively, with me and my apartment. I want to reveal, publicly, our experiences, our conversations, because... *That is where the unexpected arises...*

Shires, Jeff ((Purdue University North Central, USA))

jshires@pnc.edu

Aporia, Media and Conflict: The Rise of Ressentiment

In a cultural climate where fundamentalism is seen as potentially destructive, discourse between religious adherents and skeptics is often strained. In August, 2003, Judge Roy Moore of the Alabama Supreme Court refused a federal court order to remove a Ten Commandments monument from the state Supreme Court building's lobby. Religious law and common law mixed in a way that caused a heightening of an already tense relationship between proponents of each side. Media reports of the standoff focused on each but did not allow those voices to engage in constructive debate. A social aporia arose as both sides claimed to be upholding the letter and tradition of the United States Constitution. Aporia may be overcome through questioning basic premises of the problem. Two issues arose in this case: when does discord develop into a Nietzschean *ressentiment* and what is the role of media in defusing or inflaming an aporetic situation?

Short, Jonathan (York University, Canada)

jshort@yorku.ca

Political Sovereignty and Ethical Response

In the wake of the recent prisoner-abuse scandals in Iraq at the hands of occupying American forces, liberals (such as Michael Ignatieff), have called for more uncompromising regulations to prevent future abuses. Yet according to the work of Giorgio Agamben on the problem of political sovereignty, the power of such prospective regulations to end these abusive activities are doubtful at best. Following suggestions by Benjamin, Agamben argues that since regimes of political sovereignty rest on the claim to provide security, they depend on the construction of a secure zone or site, which in order to exist, must produce a corresponding zone of exclusion where the guarantees of security do not apply. Sites such as Abu Ghuraib and Guantanamo Bay are exemplars of this operation of sovereignty. But the radical

implication contained in Agamben's analysis of sovereignty is that reliance on the notion of inherent human dignity as the basis of human rights is an integral part of the regime of sovereignty and is to that extent discredited. The remainder of this paper is taken up with assessing Agamben's claim to found the ethical on a depiction of human being as radically potential-being. I will argue that although very close to Levinasian ethics, Agamben's ethics are too based on the project of abstract comprehension. Although the idea of potentiality is also important to Levinas, the latter's ethics feature the irreducibility of the personal, which as non-essence, transgress both the claims of philosophical comprehension and political sovereignty's imperatives for security.

Sliwinski, Sharon (York University, Canada)

sharon@yorku.ca

An Ethics of Failure: Thinking about the photographs from Abu Ghraib

The narrative of this story is gaining definition: in the era of Saddam Hussein, Abu Ghraib was one of the world's most notorious prisons, with vile living conditions, torture chambers, and often as many as one hundred executions each week in the 1980's. This notoriety has perhaps been eclipsed by the recent images leaked to the media depicting American soldiers (now using Abu Ghraib as a military prison) tormenting naked Iraqi prisoners forced to assume humiliating poses. The Pentagon first blamed these abuses on low-level, untrained G.I.'s acting without approval, but it may be that the Pentagon actually authorized this program before the invasion even began. At the very least, the Red Cross and other human rights organizations have known about and repeatedly complained about such abuses for at least a year.

One of the questions that surfaces from this pile of facts is an old one: why did this story invoke outrage only once photographs appeared? I want to spend some time trying to think about the particular disturbance these images engendered. First it must be noted that they served a dual function: the photographs (and video) were very much part of the dehumanizing process—the torturers' recording of the ordeal adds to the humiliation—and at the same time their public circulation led to a kind of outrage. What are we to make of this ambivalence in the photographic process? And how should we respond to such images? My paper will explore how the photographic encounter with ethical failure illuminates the limit of our ability to respond, which in turn may open up our notion of responsibility.

Stout, Graeme (University of Minnesota, USA)

stou0046@umn.edu

Discord, Potential and Machiavelli's Concept of Virtue

It is around the concept of virtue that Machiavelli develops his understanding of the potentialities of political action. Most readings of Machiavelli's Discourses interpret virtue (*virtù* from *l. virtus*) as a moral category which they identify with a sense of civic obligation or spirit. This is, however, an inadequate understanding of virtue and one that does not pay close enough attention to the semantics of the term in either its Latin root or its fourteenth century Italian usage. *Virtù* is not a moral quality but an indication of quality and potential – what one can do or become. Machiavelli is not interested in the question of what a people or a city-state is, but rather what these can become, what potential rests within them. Discord is that internal force which undoes social arrangements thereby demanding their re-structuring and which ensures that the city/state remains virtuous, i.e., it will continue to generate dynamic systems of thought, governance and culture. In nuce, discord produces, or, better yet, is the very pre-condition of social production.

I wish to work through Machiavelli's reading of Livy's first ten books as an object lesson in the value, one could say virtue, of discord in order to rethink this concept, not simply as a tool for political analysis or classification, but as an ontological concept. This reading of discord will place Machiavelli quite close to the more democratic Spinozist tradition of early modern thought and it will also allow for a further elaboration of the notion of potential which is so important to both thinkers and which, one might say, is another way to read virtue. What Machiavelli's reading of discord provides us with is a means to re-read the relationship between political and social discord and productivity and potential.

Machiavelli offers the first critique of and alternative to the unified nation-state with his vision of the city-state as a cosmopolitan network of power relations between cultures, classes and cities. Perhaps in such thinkers as Machiavelli and Spinoza we can find a conceptual roadmap for our own understanding of the virtue of discord in an era when the unity of the political is by no means a reality nor even a desirable one.

Swenson, Catherine (York University, Canada)

cswenson@yorku.ca

Our 'Saving Power?' Integral Vision as a Response to the Danger of Technology

In The Question Concerning Technology, Heidegger states that in the age of technology, being itself is defined only in terms of its use-value, everything is a resource. This particular manifestation of being as "Enframing" poses the greatest danger to humanity because it has the potential to strip us of our "free essence," of our role in the revealing of being in all its manifestations. We too, are resources to be used and improved just like any other. Presently, it seems that the danger posed by Enframing is only closer to being realized, as with advances in technology our lives are increasingly centered around and dependent on it. Heidegger, however, asserts that in such a dangerous time, there exists a "saving power." I want to suggest that a new understanding of being, as our "saving power," is pointed to in an intellectual and cultural movement that is based on an "integral vision" of our world. This vision posits that we are on the edge of a breakthrough in the evolution of consciousness, and that because for the first time all of human knowledge, wisdom, technology and culture, past and present, is available to all cultures, a holistic "theory of everything" can unite virtually all of the world's traditions. This integral vision allows for being to be revealed in myriad ways, and as the consciousness which develops such a theory, we can reclaim our highest dignity, which for Heidegger lies in keeping watch over the unconcealment of being. With such a vision we can reclaim our essence.

Toews, David (Michigan State University)

dtoews@msu.edu

Gabriel Tarde and Social Theory

The early 20th-century French sociologist and philosopher Gabriel Tarde was an important critic of Durkheim's ontology of the social. Recently, thinkers such as Gilles Deleuze, Bruno Latour, and Eric Alliez, have begun to revisit Tarde and to develop a theme of the significance of Tarde's thought as a harbinger of postmodern theory. Deleuze's 'Difference and Repetition' is declared by him to be based on Tarde's concept of repetition in 'Monadologie et sociologie'. Alliez, student of Deleuze and responsible for the current re-release of Tarde's oeuvre, will confirm as deliberate the correlation between Deleuze's concept of Molar vs. Molecular with the contrasting positions of Durkheim vs. Tarde. In 2002, Latour named Tarde his theoretical 'forefather'. This paper examines the usefulness of Tarde's thought for social theory in the light of this new reception. While some key limitations of Tarde's critique are identified, it is argued that Tarde developed a compelling microsociological and ontological critique of the philosophical problems of resemblance and of variation underlying Durkheim's comparative sociology.

Toews, Ryan (York University, Canada)

ryant@yorku.ca

Neoliberalism, Turnitin, and the Policing of the University

"What if the Internet could help students take more responsibility for learning and let teachers focus on teaching? Now it Can" (<http://www.turnitin.com/static/home.html>)

A key concern for contemporary left social science has been the 'recommodification' of social life and labour in the context of globalization and neoliberalism. This recommodification is characterized by, among other things, increasing surveillance by the state and by employers, as well as a re-emphasis on the responsibility of the individual to behave 'morally.'

Universities have also been transformed by these shifts, and it is perhaps ironic that critical social scientists don't always apply the same critical tools to changes in our own practices as teachers. For example, in response to the problem of internet plagiarism, university teachers have increasingly come to use Turnitin, a private internet company, to both deter and catch plagiarism. Drawing upon both contemporary Marxist scholarship on the impact of neoliberalism on the workplace, as well as Foucauldian analyses of discipline and regulation, this paper will argue that Turnitin is not simply a new and effective tool at our disposal. Rather it reflects a broader transformation in the university and in our work as university teachers in which the criminalizing practices and emphases of neoliberalism are inserted into the relationship and work of students and teachers.

Thomas, Brian (UNC)

bthomas@email.unc.edu

Current Problems in Theorizing About The Meaning of Empowerment

My aim is to make explicit a number of shortcomings that plague discussions on the meaning of empowerment currently found in the literature. I survey a broad set of disciplines and I criticize their discussions of empowerment. I categorize these problems as normative problems, power problems, the problem of false cause, and the intentional problem. I hope that it will become clear that in order to make any progress at all in talking about empowerment these problems must be addressed. Though my project is essentially negative, I also offer a positive account. This account is suggestive rather than demonstrative and I argue that a plausible account of empowerment begins with two issues: An adequate discussion of and recognition of, the concept of power and an articulation of, and a distinguishing of empowerment as a property of individuals from empowerment as a property of institutions.

Turner, Stephen (South Florida University)

turner@chuma.cas.usf.edu

The Expertization of National Violence: From Weber to Morgenthau

The dominant text in foreign policy training in the United States in the last half of the twentieth century was Hans J. Morgenthau's Politics Among Nations. The text was basic to forming the outlook of American foreign policy thinkers, and its echoes can be heard today in the speeches of the President and his national security advisors, such as Condoleezza Rice. The text is a document of emigration, deeply marked by the problem of finding a way to speak within a new political tradition. It is also marked by the interwar years. A major source of the ideas about power politics and about the nature of political responsibility to national interest is Max Weber's Political Writings, especially his constitutional writings. But Morgenthau's interpretation of these writings in the American context displace the problem of responsibility for national interests from leaders informed by their own calling to leaders informed by experts, providing an alternative solution to a common problem: how to reconcile the demands of national interest with democracy. Each solution produces characteristic problems-- the risk of a Hitler for Weber, the estrangement of foreign policy from public discourse in Morgenthau. It is open to question whether the Morgenthau solution, and with it the idea of national interest pursued by experts, is still viable.

Valle, Carla (Harvard University, USA)

carlavalle@rogers.com

Discord as Heterogeneity: Linking Micro and Macro Perspectives

The concept of heterogeneity as used in sociological theory offers a wide range of reflections on the theme of discord. Heterogeneity indicates incommensurable dimensions that cannot be reduced to a synthesis. It includes the possibility of both conflict and dialogue. The concept can be applied at various levels: on the one hand, cultural repertoires and institutional logics; on the other, interactional dynamics within or between subjects.

I develop a theory that contributes to understanding the ongoing dynamics of discord/heterogeneity across levels. I start from Norbert Wiley's semiotic theory of emergent levels and revise it by blurring the nature/society distinction and clarifying the concept of experience and its materiality.

The analysis generates a fragmented "geography of discord" where individuals and groups draw on their fluid experiences and cultural imagination to relieve discord in their lives. They appear to be striving to negotiate their ways among social structures, which, in turn, solidify lines of discord that may or may not align with those that are most affecting their lives.

Vargas-Hernandez, Jose G. (University of Guadalajara, Mexico)

vargas@cusur.udg.mx

Mexico State's Economic and Political Transition: From Entrepreneurial State to State of Entrepreneurs

Mexico is a highly centralized country with a powerful government, no reelection or, until recently, strong, open political competition. Since independence and for the last two centuries the dominant political system in Mexico has been authoritarian and presidential. Starting with the governments emerging from the Mexican Revolution (1910-17), it settled on a system of dictatorship in which the dominant party monopolized political representation and a deformed presidency. Krauze denominated the Imperial Presidency, weakening the legislature's ability to carry out its functions and duties, and diminishing judicial power. Various forms of patriarchal power represent yet another feature of the Mexican government before and after the Mexican Revolution.

Walker, Kathy (York University, Canada)

kathy@yorku.ca

I Can't Stop Watching CNN: Derrida and the A-Politics of Melancholia

In the proposed paper, I respond to the question, "What work does the work of art do?" by considering a series of relations: Derrida/metaphysics, the Chechen Black Widows/Antigone, melancholia/mourning and news media/tragedy. The crux of my argument is that where mourning fosters political work, melancholia is politically paralyzing. Ultimately I argue that Derrida, the Black Widows, and the news are characteristically melancholic. In contrast metaphysics and tragedies such as Antigone, avoid political paralysis by engaging in the work of mourning.

My argument develops upon the critique of Derrida in Gillian Rose's Mourning Becomes the Law. Rose argues that Derrida's repudiation of metaphysics results in a ceaseless aberrant mourning for the security offered by metaphysical categories. Derrida is paralyzed in a melancholic stasis. I show that tragedy, specifically Ancient Greek tragedy functions according to the structure of mourning. The play leads us through an experience of loss; we work through the loss and leave the theatre where we re-engage with our political lives. I contrast the model of tragedy to contemporary news media, which I characterize as melancholic. News has us constantly gripped by loss. We never move beyond the loss presented by the news, and therefore our mourning work is thwarted. We are melancholically trapped: I can't stop watching CNN.

Walker, Karen (York University, Canada)

K1walker@yorku.ca

Signifying Humanism: Heidegger and National Identity in Nineteenth-Century American Fiction

An integral part of the fantasy that has defined the American national identity since its inception is the ideal of universalism, or the identity of subject and object. The specific model of sovereignty in which this speculative oneness becomes manifest, or the political form this oneness takes, is a topic of much nineteenth-century American literature. I would like to investigate the relation of nineteenth-century liberal economics, in which individual economic pursuit is thought to result in universalism, to the metaphysical theory on which it is based. Specifically, I would like to look at texts that suggest that universalism cannot be achieved through atomic individualism, but rather that non-appropriative

relations with the other can only be achieved by something that approximates Heidegger's thinking. Thinking is praxis for Heidegger in that it leads to care, or the unfolding of humans into their essence, which is a humane or non-appropriative mode of Being. Since in thinking, for Heidegger, Being comes to language, I would like to look at how language, which is appropriative in its form, signifies in these texts in ways that are non-appropriative. Briefly, I will look at how several nineteenth-century literary texts engage with and bring into question the metaphysical oneness underlying the American national identity by suggesting a different relation with alterity, and how this relation can be signified, or even arrived at, through language.

Walsh, Philip (SUNY Cortland)

WALSHP@cortland.edu

Mimesis, Identity-thinking and the Evolution of Society: Adorno's Critical Anthropology

Does the cryptic opposition between myth and enlightenment, as presented in Adorno and Horkheimer's Dialectic of Enlightenment, provide the basis for a viable critical anthropology? This paper contrasts the account of mimetic (mythic) thinking in Adorno's sociological writings with his philosophical explorations of the phenomenon of identity-thinking (in Negative Dialectics and other works), which is associated with instrumental (enlightenment) rationality. The opposition expresses an alteration in the descriptive function of language that can be fruitfully compared with more recent macro-sociological accounts of the social evolution of symbolic forms. Adorno's use of this opposition is contrasted with Habermas's theory of communicative rationality and shown to bear similarities to Alfred Korzybski's theory of general linguistics.

Warner, Jamie (Marshall University)

warnerj@marshall.edu

Jon Stewart as Political Problematization: Laughter and the Refiguring of Political Action after Governmentality

As the title of this panel indicates, taking considering governmentality opens up more complex, as well as more uncommon, means of political action. This paper will argue that political comedy and satire, specifically Jon Stewart's The Daily Show, can work as just this type of political action. Specifically, The Daily Show has effectively functioned as a tactic of what Michel Foucault calls a "problematization," or the radical developing of a given into a question. Instead of focusing inward in the consolidation of already established truth claims, a problematization works to disrupt all claims, even its own. Such comic problematizations have been so successful that many have argued that The Daily Show has been one of the most effective critics of current Bush Administration's policies. This paper will examine how such comedic/satirical problematizations function, using tools of analysis from rhetorical scholar, Kenneth Burke.

Weir, Lorna (York University, Canada)

lweir@yorku.ca

Normalisation vs. Normativity

This paper will trouble current uses of "normalisation", perhaps the most successful of Foucault's concepts, in social theory and social science. I have a double aim: 1) to give greater precision to the concept of normalisation; 2) to save the concept of normativity from its erasure under normalisation. Emptied of specificity, normalisation has been inflated into a critique of normativity as such. A closer reading of Foucault shows that the Gaussian curve serves as his model of normalisation, a mathematical model too limited for contemporary practises of normalisation. But a more precise concept of normalisation does not exhaust the terrain of normative practises. Goffman shows that social interaction is intrinsically normative, and Canguilhem the inherent normativity of organic life. A critical theory that confuses normativity with normalisation founders as well at a political level in being unable to provide an account for the normative basis of its own critique as well as the range of values present and contested in contemporary politics.

Wernick, Andrew (Trent University, Canada)

awernick@mazinaw.on.ca

Differends, incommensurables, and non-negotiables: The Palestine/Israel or Israel/Palestine 'question', and why it is not possible to talk about it (even in Western universities) without coming to blows.

In so far as the distinction can be drawn, the presentation will focus not on the discord on the ground but on the discord that arises (elsewhere, in the 'West') in discussion about it, especially when such discussion takes place with tacit or explicit reference to a horizon of justice. Formally, I want to suggest, what is in play with regard to discussion (or non-discussion) of the 'question' (with its variant and incompatible formulations) of Israel/Palestine is a particularly complex and intractable example of a differend. As distinguished from a litigation, a differend would be a case of conflict, between (at least) two parties, that cannot be equitably resolved for lack of a rule of judgment applicable to both arguments' (Lyotard). At the limit, I shall argue, this second order disagreement entails a dispute between non-negotiable imperatives founded in (a singular experience of) absolute negativity. One may call this a battle over who owns victimhood – the more, now, or absolutely. Its significance, however, goes beyond the immediate parties to questions concerning the nature of the contemporary ethical universe, and the foundational place of negativity within it. I shall conclude by arguing that the meta-disputes activated by discussion of Israel/Palestine also go to the core of much that is wrong with post-enlightenment Western rationality, or at least with attempts to produce adjudicated solutions in its terms. Among the errors of much liberal-rational (and even radical) reasoning about justice are the reduction of the gift and the incapacity to take account of the symbolic – including why and with what import a traumatised/traumatizing outgrowth of what was called in the 19thC 'the Jewish question' has become a (if not the) condensation point for global contradictions at the beginning of the 21st.

Wierchosławski, Rafał Paweł (Catholic University of Lublin, Poland)

rafatw@kul.lublin.pl

Can Value Polytheism and the Preference for any Comprehensive Model of Citizenship be respected at the same time? Or Some Reflections on the Complexity of Political and Social Tissue and the Irreducible Discords it implies.

It can be argued that the notion of the 'Axiological Polytheism' (M. Weber 1917, 1919) is a key concept which characterizes Liberal Society in late modernity. We can observe its significant presence in I. Berlin's concept of two liberties (1958), and in J. Rawls's concept of the social contract under the veil of ignorance (1971), to recall some crucial examples.

I have earlier proposed (R. P. Wierchosławski 2002a, 2002b) that in spite of the acceptance of the Value Polytheism premise, it can be claimed that on the ground of the 'autopoiesis' mechanism (N. Luhmann 1987) a political community as a body can legitimately prefer a comprehensive model of citizenship in order to keep the system on track. This is supported by the 'social distribution of knowledge' argument (A. Schütz 1948/1962, P. Berger/Th. Luckmann 1966).

In this paper I will attempt to examine some problems and obstacles the argument I have defended can face when possible implementation in the fabric of social and political institutions is concerned (Ph. Pettit 1997, Ch. Delsol 2002, St. P. Turner 2003).

Winter, Elke (York University, Canada)

wintere@yorku.ca

Nation, State and Pluralism: a Sociological Approach

Recent developments such as increased immigration, transnationalism and global diasporas have come to challenge traditional notions of society, nationhood and state legitimacy. During the past decade, important scholarship has been developed with respect to the idea of (multicultural) citizenship and the recognition of cultural "difference" (e.g.

Kymlicka 1995, Taylor 1993, Parekh 2000, Benhabib 2002). Nevertheless, few scholars approach pluralist nation-building from the perspective of social theory.

In this paper, I propose a sociological framework of ethnocultural group relations within the pluralist nation(-state). My perspective is largely inspired by Max Weber's anti-evolutionary, multi-causal, and interpretative conceptualization of the social. While Weber's fundamentally anti-organic notion of "sociology without society" allows us to think societies as open, unbounded and "global" (transcending geographical space), his approach also presupposes that individuals construct the meaning and value relevance of their societal (and often local) institutions and thus define – through their actions – the relevant boundaries of the nation and its political organization. For Weber, this unavoidably involves (group) struggles over representations and resources; on the other hand, it also provides legitimacy to an otherwise unspecified bureaucracy without (national) character. While, arguably, his approach proceeds rather monologically (with emphasis on virtuous individual leadership), it nevertheless offers the possibility for inter-subjective dialog, negotiation and shifting allegiances between those involved in building the pluralist nation.

Youssef, Maisaa (University of Alberta, Canada)

myoussef@ualberta.ca

Conflict Resolution and Victims of Truth in the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict.

In this paper I argue that the principle of "truth and reconciliation" which dominates current discourse on conflict resolution reproduces the victim as the site of trauma for a second time. Specifically, linking truth to reconciliation curtails the possibility of linking reconciliation to justice. While my understanding of the principle of "truth and reconciliation" is grounded in the example of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission, this paper will focus on attempts by dissenting Israeli writers (David Grossman, Tom Segev, and others) to tell the "truth" of Palestinian suffering under Israeli rule in order to effect a reconciliation in the Middle East. Ultimately, sympathizing with the Palestinians by linking their truth to the testimony of the writers is essentially also a mechanism that circumvents a linking of that truth to justice as Palestinians would understand it; the Palestinians are reproduced as victims who may not demand or intervene.

Zaidi, Ali Hassan (York University, Canada)

ahzaidi@yorku.ca

Islam and Modernity: the Promise of a Dialogical Understanding

Echoing Roxane Euben's felicitous remark that "the study of Islamic fundamentalism suffers not from a dearth of critique but from a paucity of insight", this paper argues for a dialogical understanding of Islam and Modernity. The paper points out that the failure of the human sciences to adequately understand the emergence of contemporary Islamic and Islamist fervour stems from accounts that are too indebted to the Enlightenment view of the critique of ideology. A reconstructed dialogical theory, drawing upon both Gadamerian hermeneutics and inter-religious dialogue, not only provides more insight than post-Marxist accounts or poststructuralist theorizing into religious challenges to modernity. A reconstructed dialogical model that incorporates notions of "suspicion" and "silence" from inter-religious dialogue can also overcome the absence of critique, a charge often levelled against dialogical forms of understanding, without resorting to the Enlightenment critique of ideology. This paper argues against the ascendancy of Critical Theory in its debate with hermeneutics, and it also takes aim at deconstruction and discourse analysis, which undermine dialogical understanding. Although a reconstructed dialogical framework is not without its own problems, for instance how to overcome the chasm between a foundationalist Islamic worldview and an increasingly anti-foundationalist modern worldview, dialogical understanding remains the best prospect for cross-cultural, comparative social theory.

Zankowicz, Kate (Concordia University, Canada)

seaweedwoman@netscape.net

The Counter-Monument as Ruin: Exploring the Problematic of Remembering/Forgetting

This paper is an attempt to work through a full range of counter-monument practice. Counter-monument makers, whom I have defined as artists who critique the monument within the monumental form, are directly reacting to Robert Musil's quip that "there is nothing in the world as invisible as monuments." The reason that the monumental form is obsolete, in Musil's mind, is because "everything permanent loses its ability to impress."

This paper grapples with the fact that monuments are, in their very erection, almost already irrelevant; they signal that the memory has been lost. Indeed, rather than being memory markers, monuments may mark the displacement of memory. Since remembering is based on a distancing or mediation, regardless of how relentlessly we commemorate with them, memory is not necessarily housed in the durability of stone.

This paper addresses the perceived obsolescence of the monumental form, and the idea that monumental objects can stand in for memory. Furthermore, I will bring the concepts of the monument and the ruin closer together, and posit that the monument functions as a prosthetic memory device that, in its mode of remembrance, always includes a forgetting.

By investigating the aesthetic and epistemological cues put forth by counter-monument makers, I will suggest that the ruin is the utmost embodiment of the anti-monument. Therefore, my argument is for the necessity of ruins, in that they highlight the ephemeral nature of memory, and embrace forgetting. Paradoxically however, the counter-monument movement often suggests a re-reification of the monumental form, even if it is only in the form of a disappearance. Therefore, though it may be that the counter-monument serves to re-fetishize a lost object, like Jochen Gerz's sinking stele for instance, the monument-as-ruin is part of monumentality itself. Nevertheless, by building ruins, these monument makers are openly acknowledging the oblivion upon which remembering depends.